

## **Resilience:**

Survivor Experiences and Expressions

# **Thematic Paper**

### The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project

A Chab Dai study on (Re-)integration: Researching the lifecycle of sexual exploitation & trafficking in Cambodia

**Thematic Paper December 2014** 

- Report Author : Todd Morrison
- Contributing Authors : Siobhan Miles, Priscilla Schafer, Heang Sophal, Lim Vanntheary, Sreang Phally & Nhanh Channtha







### "I like what I am today."

-Female Survivor, Age 26, 2012

## **RESILIENCE:**

Survivor Experiences And Expressions

### DECEMBER, 2014

**REPORT AUTHOR:** Todd Morrison

#### **CONTRIBUTING AUTHORS:**

Siobhan Miles Priscilla Schafer Heang Sophal Lim Vanntheary Nhanh Channtha Sreang Phally

### Acknowledgements

For this research to occur we have partnered with many people and organizations, and have had generous support from our donors. We want to thank Equitas as our original donor for continuing to fund us this past year and for believing in this project. We also want to thank Tenth, Imago Dei, LOVE146, Earth Heir and an anonymous donor for their financial support and encouragement.

We value each of the Assistance Programs partnering in this research and appreciate their willingness to accommodate and keep us informed about clients in their programs. We also appreciate their feedback to us about the findings and recommendations. We would specifically like to thank the following organizations who have signed Memorandums of Understanding with us for this project: Agape International Mission (AIM), American Rehabilitation Ministries (ARM) in Battambang and Siem Riep, Bloom Asia, Cambodian Hope Organization (CHO), Citipointe International Care and Aids, Daughters, Destiny Rescue, Hagar Cambodia, Healthcare Centre for Children (HCC), International Justice Mission (IJM), Pleroma Home for Girls, Garden of Hope in Cambodia, Ratanak International, Transitions Global, World Hope International and World Vision.

We thank the following people for their contributions:

Ms. Helen Sworn, International Director of Chab Dai, for her vision, direction and enthusiasm for the research.

Mr. Ruos Yeng, Country Director of Chab Dai Coalition, for his support and encouragement.

Ms. Orng Muylen, Finance Director of Chab Dai coalition, for her tireless efforts in adjusting the budgets and liaising with our donors.

Mr. Sun Varin, Senior Coalition Manager of Chab Dai Coalition, for his support and encouragement.

Dr. Glenn Miles, Research Advisor to Chab Dai Coalition, for his insights and advice.

Dr. Jill K. Reimer, for contributing valuable advice and comments to the final draft.

Rebecca Surtees, for contributing valuable advice and comments to the final draft.

Ms. Hannah Sworn, for helping to proofread the paper.

To view the 'Working paper' on 'Resilience: Survivor Experiences and Expressions' please access:

Morrison, Todd. Miles, Siobhan. Heang, Sophal. Lim, Vanntheary. Sreang, Phally. Nhanh, Channtha. (2014), 'Working Paper, Resilience: Survivor Experiences and Expressions ', *The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project: A Chab Dai study on (Re-) integration: Researching the lifecycle of sexual exploitation & trafficking in Cambodia* (Phnom Penh: Chab Dai).

www.freedomcollaborative.org/library

and/or www.chabdai.org.

## **Table of Contents**

1.0	Introduction	1
2.0	Resilience – Working Definition	2
2.	1 Survivor Resilience	2
	Culture and Resilience	4
	Physical Health and Resilience	6
	Employment and Resilience	6
	Longitudinal Resilience Studies	7
2.	2 Survivor Vulnerabilities and Risk Factors During (Re-) Integration	8
2.	3 (Re-) Integration in Cambodia	12
	(Re-) Integration Challenges	13
3.0	Study Scope and Methods	15
4.0	Results and Discussion	19
4.	1 Survivor Milestones and Transitions	19
4.	2 Relationships	25
4.	3 Discrimination	34
4.	4 Push Pull Factors	39
4.	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
	Hope for the Future	47
	Introspection	48
	Interconnectedness	50
	Perseverance	51
	Self Preservation and Steadied Decision Making	54
	Adaptability	55
5.0	Summary and Conclusions	57
5.	1 Factors Important to Personal Well-Being	57
	Relationships	57
	Discrimination	58
	Employment Opportunities and Family Earnings	58
	Expressions of Well-Being	59
5.	2 Longitudinal Assessment of Resilience	60
	Positive and Negative Turning Points	60
	Decision Making in the Community	61
	Expressions of Resilience	62
5.	3 Study Limitations	62
5.	4 Implications for Future Research	63
6.0	Bibliography	65

## List of Tables and Figures

Table 1: Survivor Cohort Summary Statistics, 2011-2014         16
Table 2: Male and Female Survivor Cohort Summary Used in the Assessment, 2011-201416
Table 3: Male and Female Survivor Cohort Visits Used in the Assessment, 2011-2014         17
Table 4: Statistics for Individuals Included in the Assessment, 2011-2014
Table 5: Percent of Survivors Single or Married/Partners in 2014
Table 6: Survivor Expressions of Re-integration and Personal Well-Being, 2011-2014
Table 7: Survivor Decision Making Regarding Higher Risk Behaviors and Situations, 2011-201424
Table 8: Total Counts and Individuals Expressing Positive and Negative Family Relationships, 2011-
2014
Table 9: Total Counts for Family Relationships Expressed by Survivors within Shelter and Community,
2011-2014
Table 10: Total Count of Family Problems Expressed by Survivors within Shelter and Community,
2011-2014
Table 11: Survivor Experiences of Discrimination from Family, Shelters and Programs, and the
Community, 2011-201435
Table 12: Push Pull Factors Expressed by Survivors, 2011-2014    39
Table 13: Average Push / Pull Factors for Select Themes, 2011-2014
Table 14: Re-integrated Survivor Expressions of Satisfaction and Happiness Along with Select Themes,
2011-2014
Table 15: Survivor Expressions of Resilience, 2011-2014
Table 16: Hope for the Future Expressed by Survivors in the Community
Table 17: Perseverance Expressed by Survivors in the Community
Table 18: Self-Preservation Decision Making Expressed by Survivors in the Community
Table 19: Adaptability Expressed by Survivors in the Community       56
Figure 1: Comprehensive List of Research Survey Questions Used in the Assessment
Figure 2: Major Life Milestones and Transitions20
Figure 3: (Re-) Integration Transitions for Survivors in Shelter Programs21
Figure 4: Female Cohort Relationships with Partners and Spouses, 2011-201429
Figure 5: Female Cohort Relationships With Family Members Other Than Spouses, 2011-201433
Figure 6: Male Cohort Relationships With Family Members, 2011-2014
Figure 7: Male (Re-) Integration Experiences With People in the Community, 2011-2014
Figure 8: Female (Re-) Integration Experiences With People in the Community, 2011-2014
Figure 9: Earnings in the Family Unit Following (Re-) Integration for Male Cohorts, 2011-201441
Figure 10: Earnings in the Family Unit Following (Re-) Integration for Female Cohorts, 2011-201442

### **Discourse Regarding Definitions**

#### HUMAN TRAFFICKING

Defined by the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Article 3

"...the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harboring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of a position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation. Exploitation shall include, at a minimum. The exploitation of the prostitution of others or other forms of sexual exploitation, forced labor or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery, servitude or the removal of organs."

#### **RE-INTEGRATION**

There are no universally accepted definitions of 'integration' or 're-integration' (COMMIT, 2010), the discussion on a common definition of re-integration has evolved over time within various contexts:

In 'Monitoring Anti-Trafficking Re/Integration Programs: A Manual' (Surtees, 2010), successful (re-)integration is defined in the *Trafficking Victims Re/Integration* (TVRP) as:

"Recovery and economic and social inclusion following a trafficking experience. This includes settlement in a stable and safe environment, access to a reasonable standard of living, mental and physical wellbeing, and opportunities for personal, social and economic development, and access to a social and emotional support. It may involve returning to one's family and/or community of origin; it may also involve integration in a new community and even in a new country. TVRP criteria for determining if an individual has been successfully (re-) integration includes: 1) safe and affordable accommodation, 2) legal status, 3) [professional and employment opportunities, 4) education and training opportunities, 5) security and safety, 6) healthy social environment (including anti-discrimination and anti-marginalization), 7) social wellbeing, 11) access to services and opportunities, 12) motivation and commitment to (re-) integration [process, 13) legal issues and court proceedings, and 14) wellbeing of secondary beneficiaries."

#### **TYPES OF ASSISSTANCE PROGRAMS** partnering in the Butterfly Longitudinal Research<sup>1</sup>

'Shelter' refers to assistance a participant receives whilst residing in the shelter. 'Community Program' refers to assistance on the form of employment and possibly in addition psychosocial/ spiritual support/ further training. 'Transition home' and 'Family group home' refers to assistance at some level in a group accommodation. 'Training program,' refers to any participant who is undergoing a type of skills training. The participant can be out in the community or in any type of residential program whilst receiving this training.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The majority of the Assistance programs partnering in the Butterfly Longitudinal project describe themselves as Christian Faith Based ministries or non government organizations.

### **EXECUTIVE SUMMARY**

**Objective:** The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project seeks to learn about the (re-) integration of survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking in Cambodia through following a select group of individuals over a ten-year period. The purpose of this paper is to build a broad understanding of resilience using the collective 'voices' of survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking in Cambodia. Through disseminating their 'voice' and the research findings locally, regionally and globally, Chab Dai believes (re-) integration programming and policy will be informed and advanced, thereby directly improving the quality of life for survivors of sexual exploitation in Southeast Asia and around the world.

**Methods:** The thematic assessment utilizes four consecutive years of data (2011 to 2014) compiled from 994 interviews involving 109 study participants. Relevant summary data as well as detailed responses are compiled and reviewed as they related to six basic themes within the overarching study. These themes include participants' responses, attitudes, perceptions and experiences related to 'trust', 'relationships', 'debt', 'stigma' 'discrimination', and 'violence'.

The participants are divided into four assessment groups based on gender and whether or not they lived in a shelter program for at least 4 months. They include: 1) females in shelter programs that have not yet (re-) integrated (N=32), 2) females that were in shelter programs and have already (re-) integrated (N=34), 3) females that did not stay in shelter programs and have already (re-) integrated (N=28), and 4) males that were in shelter programs and have already (re-) integrated (N=15).

**Results and Conclusions:** Survivor expressions of resilience in many ways demonstrate their ability to adapt in challenging life circumstances. Survivors express feelings of well-being and at other times demonstrate perseverance during challenges and adversity.

Longitudinal Assessment: The longitudinal assessment follows participants through several important milestones and transitions<sup>2</sup>. While the data in this assessment spans only the first four years, almost all the participants will reach young adulthood over the ten-year study time frame. There are other transitions happening as well. A total of 49 participants (re-) integrate into the community from shelter programs and transition homes during the assessment time frame. Survivors' re-enter schools or start job training programs and left/graduate from schools and various NGO work and training programs to find employment in the community. Maturing, making decisions regarding life directions and relationships, and learning to live independently are all topics survivors discuss as they moved through transitions.

Marriage is an important societal milestone that most participants have not reached yet. There are many single participants in this study, perhaps as many as 90 individuals out of 109 in 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Major life milestones include events such as getting married, graduating from school or job training, or having a child. Transitions include important life changes for a person such as reaching young adulthood and (re-) integration for survivors (see Section 4.1 for additional detail).

During initial interviews, almost all female survivors express the desire to be married to an honest and supportive husband and start a family. This transition, however, will be difficult for most survivors to navigate; they will have to confront cultural stigmas, meet family expectations, and merge differing generational viewpoints that often add to the complexity of the situation. The degree to which these survivors can foster supportive and encouraging relationships with spouses will likely determine for many whether this milestone becomes a major positive or negative turning point in their lives going forward.

**Relationships:** The majority of married participants in this study are struggling in their relationships with spouses and their spouses' parents. Within the oldest assessment grouping, 15 of the 19 participants married or involved in long-term relationships describe a negative relationship with their boyfriend or spouse and/or his parents over their last year interviewed. Nine of these 15 participants recount negative conditions for two or more consecutive years. The majority describe living with their in laws at some point after marriage and spoke of the difficulty adjusting to their new family unit. Unfortunately many participants describe enduring years of alcohol related physical violence, emotional abuse, physical threats, infidelity, drug addiction, and abandonment by their husbands or boyfriends and the family in law. Although there are few married participants in other assessment groups, they also faced similar challenges in developing supportive and encouraging marriages. Survivors describe their experiences in their own words:

- ⇒ I was deceived again and again by men. I did not want to have another relationship with a man because all of these love experiences make me broken hearted and my heart aches very much. -Female Survivor, Age 23, 2013
- ⇒ Every night I cannot sleep unless I drink alcohol because I feel depressed with my husband, as he often does not come home and when he does he is violent toward me.
   –Female Survivor, Age 33, 2012

Relationships with mothers are the most important family relationship identified by younger participants living in shelter programs and the community. Positive relationships between mothers and young survivors may significantly influence resiliency in their lives, helping them, as they become young adults. Some individuals speak about this:

- $\Rightarrow$  Although my family is poor, we are living together without arguments. -Female Survivor, Age 19, 2013
- ⇒ Every time I have a problem my mother always comforts me. I trust my parents the most. -Female Survivor, Age 16, 2013

Unfortunately, family problems and troubled relationships are all too common and often a consistent theme year to year with (re-) integrating participants. At home, female participants often describe conflicts with their family stemming from disagreements over relationships with boyfriends / partners and arranged marriages. In some instances, survivors place themselves at risk of family related violence because of their choices to continue personal and intimate relationships without their family's approval (either their own family or their boyfriend's family).

**Discrimination and (Re-) Integration Experiences in the Community:** Discrimination following (re-) integration is a serious concern exposed by almost half of the female survivors at least once during the assessment. Throughout the four years included in this assessment, participants describe a range of people involved in discriminating against them because of their past experiences, from husbands, long-term partners, and family members to peers and people in the wider society, such as teachers and neighbors. Neighbors, fellow students, and family in laws also discriminate and stigmatize some participants for being poor or coming from poor families. Participants in school specifically report discrimination and stereotyping of "shelter girls" from classmates (this occurred with participants in shelter programs and following (re-) integration). One female student describes her experience in school this way:

⇒ Friends at school made me feel unhappy because they mocked me and say bad words about me. I felt they were discriminating against me because they know that I used to live in a shelter. They say that shelter children were sexually exploited and raped until they got pregnant without a husband. -Female Survivor, Age 13, 2012

Interestingly male survivors did not express being discriminated against by family or the community. The majority of male participants describe positive experiences with neighbors and co-workers in the community after (re-) integration. Some describe conflicts with supervisors and fights with neighbors as well, but they do not attributed these conflicts to stigma or discrimination. This assessment is limited to a small sample size (15 individuals) and further study will be needed to determine the extent of discrimination against male survivors in the community.

Female survivors express positive and negative experiences in the community with neighbors, friends, and co-workers. Following (re-) integration some survivors speak about the time it took for them to develop friends and supportive relationships in the community. Others describe kind landlords and support from the head of their commune. At the same time, a considerable number of participants indicate that they keep their past a secret from co-workers, neighbors, and even from husbands and family members. Older participants talk about conflict and discrimination in their community from neighbors and co-workers over multiple years. Moving locations and changing jobs does not always make the situation positive with some participants seemly caught in cycles of conflict with their neighbors and co-workers wherever they went. An older survivor shares her experience with discrimination by co-workers in the community in this way:

⇒ They begin to stop talking to me when they know my past. They misjudge me and no longer consider me a good person. They share my story with a new person who just came to work with us. –Female Survivor, Age 27, 2012

<u>Push and Pull Factors</u><sup>3</sup>: In this assessment push and pull factors are assessed as they related to survivor decisions making and life experiences involving starting and stopping job training

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Push and Pull factors are a set of common themes or things that act to drive people away from (push) residences and/or employment and draw people toward (pull) a new residence and/or place of employment (see Section 4.4 for additional detail).

programs, starting and leaving various jobs, moving within Cambodia and migrating to other countries for perceived better employment opportunities, and forming and re-forming family units. Participants often talk about multiple decisions and in many cases multiple moves (in and/or location) during a given year. Survivors express thirteen common themes that acted as push and pull factors in their lives. Participants talk most often about debt, insufficient earnings, and obligations to financially support family members. Participants in shelter programs rarely mention five themes that became important to many participants following (re-) integration (unemployment, family health, pregnancy, community stigma, and perceived better employment opportunity).

The pursuit of improved economic opportunities is both an important push factor and constant concern for survivors and their families. The assessment suggests most families of participants struggle to earn enough money to survive. Several families have migrated to Thailand looking for work. Many male survivors worry about money and others speak about the feelings of loneliness and abandonment in having their mothers leave them to go and find work in Thailand. One survivor states:

⇒ If you don't bring me to Thailand with you (mother), I will not eat and stop going to school. I will just ride my bike around and try and get into trouble. I want to live with my mother. -Male Survivor, Age 14, 2014

There are several survivors that speak about improving financial situations. Most survivors that have sufficient earnings in their family do so because more than one member of the family is contributing money. Many participants that indicate they are earning enough money to meet their family needs are employed by NGOs. Cleaning services in the hospitality industry and supervisors in the garment industry are two positions in private industry where survivors are working successfully and earning a sufficient income for their families. One participant describes her work in the garment industry in 2013 and 2014:

- ⇒ I have been working in a garment factory for 6 months. My salary is \$130 per month and I think my salary is enough for my daily spending. -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2013
- ⇒ At my workplace they promoted me to be a team leader. My salary has increased. -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2014

**Expressions of Well-Being:** Both groups [in the shelter programs and (re-) integrated] express feeling satisfied and happy with various aspects of life. Participants also express worry about life. Worries in the shelter include concerns over family members at home, future (re-) integration, studies / school, and court cases. Those that have already (re-) integrated tend to worry more about issues related to sickness, debt, earning enough to survive, earning money while in school/training, unemployment, and children. Many of participants express that life in the shelter programs is good for them and note the love they receive from staff and shelter moms. After (re-) integration many survivors remark that life is more difficult outside the shelter.

No participant describes feeling satisfied and happy if they feel there is no positive family relationship present in their life. Results for survivors expressing happiness and satisfaction living in the community identify only two instances where participants express feelings of wellbeing along with insufficient financial earnings and only four instances where participants identify feelings of well-being along with discrimination. No participant describes feeling satisfied and happy when there is only a negative family relationship in his or her life. The results suggest that these three themes play an important role in determining well-being and resilience among survivors in the community. One survivor spoke of the difficulties she faces with an abusive husband and no other positive family relationships in her life for three years:

⇒ I have never experienced happiness since I married my husband. He never takes care of me. He never gives me any money to support our family. I have to find food to eat by picking vegetables from around the house.... I want to separate from my husband and take my child with me but my husband and family in law have said I can go but I must leave our child with them. -Female Survivor, Age 20, 2014

**Decision Making in the Community:** Once survivors (re-) integrate, decision-making and the structures or parental figures that help guide these processes shift from shelters back to families and/or the individuals themselves. Some of the younger participants that have already (re-) integrated describe parental figures participating in this process by allowing them more or less personal freedoms. Generally among the groups, more male participants struggle to make good decisions regarding drugs/alcohol while more female participants struggle with choices in relationships and domestic violence. Participants in the oldest age group describe making high-risk decisions independently. In general, parental relationships, either positive or negative, are likely to impact decision making and relationship building for a substantial group of participants as they grow into young adults.

The longitudinal assessment provides the opportunity to better understand push and pull factors at work in the lives of survivors. This assessment clearly shows that decision making among survivors is complex and not just related to financial earnings. Over the four years evaluated, (re-) integrated participants identified every one of thirteen push and pull factors, at one time or another, as the important decision making factor. Many times these factors seem to converge as survivors describe their decisions and the resulting life changes.

The Struggle to Steady Life: (Re-) integrated survivors' state "adaptability" the fewest number of times in the assessment of resilience. Many participants found it difficult to balance work and other important life obligations. In many instances NGO programs are helpful in connecting survivors with support structures such as church/religious communities and even other NGOs in their locale. However, based on the assessment most survivors themselves are not knowledgeable enough or skilled enough to develop their own networks apart from the local community in which they lived. No participant describes connecting into another organization or church/religious community apart from NGO assistance. These groups, when present, are identified as an important, yet missing connection point for survivors.

Note: You can find the Executive Summary in Khmer at the last part of this paper.

#### **1.0 Introduction**

The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project seeks to learn about the (re-) integration of survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking in Cambodia by following a select group of individuals over a ten-year period. The study began in 2010 and completed four years of data collection in 2014. The purpose of this study is to listen to the 'voice' of survivors and to gain an understanding of their perspectives and experiences as they (re-) integrate into society. Through disseminating their 'voice' and the research findings locally, regionally and globally, Chab Dai believes (re-) integration programming and policy will be informed and advanced, thereby directly improving the quality of life for survivors of sexual exploitation.

The purpose of this paper is to build a broad understanding of resilience using the collective 'voices' of survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking in Cambodia. As you read, take a moment to listen to these survivors and their expressions of resilience:

- ⇒ Before I blamed myself a lot, but now I don't. I know more and I have new ideas and I don't dwell on my past problems. Female Survivor, Age 17, 2013
- ⇒ When I reintegrated, I am now totally responsible on my own. I can control myself even I am happy or unhappy. I must serve myself. – Female Survivor, Age 19, 2012
- ⇒ I am scared because soon I will reintegrate back home and I will have many responsibilities to look after my mother and myself. I want to take responsibility for myself but I worry about it. –Female Survivor, Age 22, 2013
- ⇒ We should hide in the shelter and wait until the problem we had in our past goes away, and as it goes we can forget about the people outside as they forget about us. So when we come out [of the shelter] we can know we are not the same even if society still says we are bad. – Female Survivor, Age 13, 2011
- ⇒ I felt angry. I didn't want to reintegrate. When I reintegrated, I cried. I didn't know what to do, they wanted me to leave the shelter, and I had to leave. Now the reintegration assistance support is not enough. Twenty USD a month and a bicycle is not enough money for me to continue studying. The shelter social workers only come for less than ten minutes every few months so they do not know my difficulty. – Female Survivor, Age 19, 2012

#### 2.0 **Resilience – Working Definition**

Resilience is broadly defined as the capacity of a person to withstand challenging life circumstances and persevere in the face of adversity (such as financial stress, social stigma/exclusion, violence/trauma, poor health, death of a loved one). Goldstein (1997)<sup>4</sup>, offers a wide conceptual framework for resilience suggesting it encompasses "both the capacity to be bent without breaking and the capacity once bent to spring back". In this way, resilience draws on and interacts with a learned set of internal assets or skill sets, behaviors, thoughts, and actions that affect positive adaptation, growth, and/or change over time.

Resilience is a concept that requires a combination of both internal assets and external resources. Resilience can originate through external resources such as supportive relationships with family, friends, professional care providers, and other people helping a person cope with adversity and challenging circumstances. According to Goldstein, resilience is part environmental in that it *"arises out of and is nourished by interpersonal and social processes"* (Goldstein 1997<sup>1</sup>). Ungar (2008), provides an integrated definition encapsulating the interaction of resilience between the individual and her/his social environment:

In the context of exposure to significant adversity, whether psychological, environmental, or both, resilience is both the capacity of individuals to navigate their way to health-sustaining resources, including opportunities to experience feelings of well-being, and a condition of the individual's family, community and culture to provide these health resources and experiences in culturally meaningful ways (Ungar, 2008: 225).

#### 2.1 Survivor Resilience

There is a range of studies evaluating various aspects of resiliency in lives of survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking. These studies identify factors that strengthen and positively influence recovery from sexual exploitation and abuse, explore the strengths and weaknesses of various protective components of resilience and relationships between these components and select vulnerabilities, and demonstrate the importance of professional interventions in positively affecting resilience trajectories. The following sections discuss these various aspects of resilience in greater detail.

Recent studies highlight the importance of personal and interpersonal aspects of resilience and how these interact and influence survivors' recovery. The following are brief study descriptions:

 Nowak-Carter (2012) sought to identify the protective factors most influential in survivor recovery. Through in-depth interviews with service providers assisting sex trafficking survivors in various parts of the world, the author identified four groups of protective factors: relationships, education, disposition, and environment (Nowak-Carter 2012). Of all these factors, relationships are identified as being by far the most influential. Relationships facilitating recovery stem from a variety of areas included strong support from one's family, becoming a caregiver, support from one's community, and belonging to a faith community. Nowak-Carter put forth that the most influential

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Authors quoted in Nowak-Carter (2012: 10-11)

factors are such because they contribute to sex trafficking survivors' sense of belonging, of purpose and of meaning.

- Noltemeyer and Bush (2013) conduct a review of international research on adversity and resilience and further highlight the importance of relationships with family and community to developing survivors' psychosocial resilience. Cross-cultural family factors fostering resilience include: family cohesion and adaptability, effective parental communication skills, stable marital/couple relationships, and parental practices that are responsive, nurturing, monitoring, consistent, firm, supportive and warm. Parental practices, specifically parental responsiveness and supportive behaviors also play an important role in a child's ability to develop secure attachment relationships, a key protective factor for a child's resilience throughout their lives (Noltemeyer and Bush 2013).
- A study of children exposed to sexual abuse and sexual exploitation in Addis Ababa, Ethiopia identifies three themes that facilitated recovery from sexual abuse/exploitation (Yntiso et al. 2009). These themes include survivors that possessed motivation and determination to recover, the presence of external support during recovery, and a welcoming environment during (re-) integration into family and society. The study also discusses the need for a positive environment and external support in order to sustain resilience in survivors upon (re-) integration.

While these studies highlight various important aspects of resilience, collectively they underscore the point that encouraging and supportive relationships have perhaps the greatest potential to positively influence resilience trajectory among survivors.

Gray et al. (2012) explores interactions between protective factors of resilience and psychosocial functioning in Cambodian youth. The authors conduct interviews with 24 trafficking survivors in a shelter and 24 students from a rural school who had not experienced exploitation, all aged between 13 and 22. Using scalar assessment tools they evaluate senses of mastery, relatedness, and emotional reactivity (all elements of psychological resilience) in conjunction with symptoms of depression and anxiety. The authors hypothesize that the Cambodian youth presenting higher levels of mastery and relatedness (deemed protective components of resilience) would show less depression and anxiety. They found that mastery is the primary factor reducing psychological consequences of exploitation, whereas relatedness appears to be less important. They also hypothesize that levels of mastery and relatedness would correlate with age. They found that mastery is positively associated to age, but that relatedness is not. This suggests that relatedness can be developed at all ages. They further hypothesize that the young women who had survived trauma would score higher in mastery and relatedness and lower in anxiety and depression than those from the rural school. Their study confirms this hypothesis, but in the limitations, the authors emphasize that this post-traumatic growth or positive adaptation may result not only from exposure to trauma, but also from access to better support systems in the shelter and/or from their higher age average.

Gray (2012) identifies elements of resilience in the young Cambodian survivors of trafficking through a thematic analysis of the qualitative data. The nine constructs of resilience that emerge from the researchers' analysis are perseverance, adaptability, self-preservation, interconnectedness, hope for the future, buoyancy, introspection, steadiness, and social awareness. The author describes these themes as follows (Gray 2012):

- 1) Perseverance diligent, determined, and resourceful in their pursuits
- 2) Adaptability their ability to successfully navigate changes in their environment and adjust to challenges
- 3) Self-preservation behavior ensuring these young women's survival, expressed through the use of humor, determined attitudes, and intuition
- 4) Interconnectedness described through survivors' relationship with their families, but to a lesser extent also with friends in school and with a mentor
- 5) Hope for the future entailed setting and achieving personal goals in order to move forward and avoid dwelling on past traumatic experiences
- 6) Buoyancy expressed by using extroversion to build relationships with others
- 7) Introspection being reflective on and aware of one's inner feelings is part of the healing process
- 8) Steadiness being grounded or consistent in doing the right things no matter what, especially with regards to maintaining good family relationships
- Social awareness involved both the capacity to feel empathy and to establish healthy connections with others (a desire to help others who, like themselves, had experienced trauma)

Many studies stress the importance of professional interventions in strengthening and positively influencing survivor resilience and recovery from sexual exploitation and abuse (Gozdziak et al. 2006; Abu-Ali and Al-Bahar 2011; Gray et al. 2012; Sobon 2015). Gray et al. (2012) recommend interventions that increase mastery as a means of strengthening resilience to future adversity. They advise that these interventions be implemented as early as possible to reduce traumatic symptoms and be "age-appropriate methods of cultivating increased psychological functioning, mastery and competence, in addition to engendering overall resilience" (Gray et al. 2012: 368). These recommendations suggest that post-traumatic growth is fostered and resilience strengthened in survivors who receive assistance immediately after rescue from trafficking and/or sexual exploitation.

#### **Culture and Resilience**

Various studies highlight the important of culture and context on resilience (Ungar 2008; 2013; Ungar and Liebenberg 2011; Abu-Ali and Al-Bahar 2011; Masten 2014). Masten (2014) reviews the literature for resilience studies in children and youth and highlights the recent advances globally in research evaluating resilience in local, cultural contexts. Ungar (2008) focuses on cross-cultural research finding resilience-building factors among youth who had experienced trauma. The study evaluates over 1,500 young people in 14 different locations around the world and presents four propositions on the cultural embeddedness of resilience (Ungar 2008):

1) There are both global, as well as culturally and contextually specific aspects to young people's lives that contribute to their resilience

- 2) Aspects of resilience exert differing amounts of influence on a child's life depending on the specific culture and context in which resilience is realized
- 3) Aspects of children's lives that contribute to resilience are related to one another in patterns that reflect a child's culture and context
- 4) Tensions between individuals and their cultures and contexts are resolved in ways that reflect specific relationships between aspects of resilience

Research shows the socio-cultural aspect of survivor's environment is an important factor in fostering resilience. Studies recommend that interventions aiming to build the resilience of children and youth at risk in different cultures take into account *"local knowledge about aspects of resilience"* (Unger 2008: 233). Abu-Ali and Al-Bahar (2011) recommends that psychotherapists explore a child's perceptions of culture and community in order to maintain the cultural context when working with a child's sense of belonging and (re-) integration. The authors suggest caregivers emphasize local knowledge and social strengths when working with a child to foster a *"positive and integrated sense of self and others"* (Abu-Ali and Al-Bahar 2011: 796). Lastly, child survivors may need to understand other feelings regarding cultural factors if family reintegration proves impossible.

A study conducted in Nepal by Crawford and Kaufman (2008) shows that it is possible to facilitate stigma-reducing change within the socio-cultural environment and thereby support (re-) integration of survivors. In Nepal the stigma surrounding prostitution is so strong that the survivor's presence in the community is perceived as bringing shame not only upon her family, but also the whole community. Despite these overwhelming adversities, Crawford and Kaufman found that three quarters of the survivors in their sample experience a successful family reintegration. The authors contribute these successes in part to a local NGO operated entirely by Nepalese women who had extensive experience, local knowledge, and cultural insight. Survivors are equipped with skills to generate an income, which gave them the ability to provide for themselves and their family, a potential source of status and prestige in the culture (Crawford and Kaufman 2008). By strengthening survivor skill sets and reducing stigma, survivors are well positioned to gain community support during (re-) integration.

Young Cambodian survivors of trafficking exhibit culturally distinct aspects of resilience. Gray (2012) describes features of resilience culturally distinct or unique to Cambodian youth, particularly when compared to western definitions and features of resilience. According to the author, select young women use their sense of humor as an aspect of resilience to deflect or disconnect from feelings associated with sexual abuse and cultural stigma. In these situations humor and the ability to laugh are considered aspects of self-protection whereas these behaviors in western cultures may be viewed as denial or avoidance. Interestingly, other young Cambodian women exhibit demeanors that are quiet and more introverted, characterized by the author as internally focused and self-preserved (Gray 2012). These behaviors may at times be considered passivity in western cultures. The author also discussed "autonomy" and "self sufficiency" as important aspects of resilience in western cultures whereas aspects such as "family and community support" and "connection and support" are important components of resilience in Cambodian society. These aspects of resilience are culturally embedded in

Cambodian society and considered appropriate ways of coping with adversity. Gray emphasized that "[t]hese young women are survivors – not because they have been rescued from an inevitable fate – but because they have intentionally overcome obstacles and developed the internal and external means to cope with complex trauma" (Gray 2012: 14).

#### **Physical Health and Resilience**

Literature suggests that resilience is not limited to psychosocial factors but also takes into account physical themes. Physical resilience factors are often discussed in the literature through the themes of health, security during the reintegration process, and safe future migration (Jobe 2010; Abu-Ali and Al-Bahar 2011). Strengthening the provisions of health and security of survivors is of paramount importance from the moment they are rescued and enter assistance programs until they pass through (re-) integration. Indeed these components of physical resilience are important throughout a survivor's life. Survivors' physical resilience may also include decisions to attempt migrating again. Some take the risk in the presence of a worsening family financial situation, some in an effort to finance education in the future, and some in order to repay debts resulting from their first migration attempt (Jobe 2010). Sometimes survivors may be pushed to risk migration even through contacts who are linked to the first experience which resulted in their being trafficked. One or all of these factors often play important roles in the physical resilience of survivors.

#### **Employment and Resilience**

Employment and resilience are discussed together in literature in numerous ways. Often studies describe employment as a protecting factor for resilience that can "open up opportunities" or can be a major turning point in lives of people (positive or negative; Werner 1993; Nowak-Carter 2012). Survivors themselves often link employment to self-identity, self-confidence, and increased social status (Crawford and Kaufman 2008; Nowak-Carter 2012; Miles et al. 2013). Studies of resilience in rural communities in Cambodia refer to employment by discussing the need to diversify and strengthen the livelihood base for individuals (Nuorteva 2009). Studies involving resilience and survivors of sexual trafficking allude to this describing job assistance as a way for survivors to "move on" with their lives (Gray 2012). Other studies stress that survivors need to become economically empowered, with the pursuit of improved economic opportunities often a long-term concern for survivors and their families (Surtees 2012). Correspondingly, survivor job training, referral, and assistance are core components in most successful (re-) integration assistance programs.

Libório and Ungar (2010) present a discussion on the potential benefits of certain forms of work for children's resilience, both from a psychosocial and an economic perspective. This is interesting because, as other authors have pointed out, child survivors continue to be preoccupied by the need to make money, either due to family pressure or out of a sense of filial piety, which is a strong cultural value in Asia (Steinfatt 2003; Abu-Ali and Al-Bahar 2011; Gray 2012). Libório and Ungar distinguish child labor, which is exploitative and harmful to child development, from child work, which includes "processes of engagement in the economy that provide some reasonable opportunity for gain for the child" (Libório and Ungar 2010: 327). They agree that child labor which is exploitative, excessively demanding, harmful, and dangerous must be eradicated.

Libório and Ungar (2010) organize seven cross-culturally homogenous aspects of resilience in youth to show "how children's experience of participation in economic activity [...] contributes to positive development in stressful and resource poor environments" (Libório and Ungar 2010: 329). A table depicting the aspects of resilience identified from children's work and their potential positive developmental effects are outlined below.

Potential benefits of childre	en's work for their resilience
Aspects of resilience	Potential positive developmental effects
Access to material resources	<ul> <li>helps overcome scarcity and uncertainty</li> <li>helps provide for the family's basic needs</li> </ul>
Cultural adherence	-the child is a contributing member of the family and community -supports a culture of mutual dependency
Identity	<ul> <li>-can teach useful skills when school is unavailable</li> <li>-can improve responsibility and autonomy</li> <li>-can promote self-respect and respect from family</li> </ul>
Power and control	-can improve personal agency & social status
Relationships	<ul> <li>-socialization, affection, play &amp; friendship</li> <li>-sense of belonging and solidarity</li> </ul>
Social justice	-contributes to family welfare -may buffer the impact of an abusive home -material resources help address marginality
Social cohesion	<ul> <li>-sense of productive place in society</li> <li>-conforms to cultural value of owing parents</li> <li>support</li> <li>-provides help in hardship</li> </ul>

Source: Libório and Ungar, 2010: 330-331

#### **Longitudinal Resilience Studies**

To our knowledge no longitudinal studies exist specifically focused on survivor resilience and (re-) integration. Cross sectional studies of survivor resilience identify time as a limiting factor in their data sets suggesting longitudinal studies may bring greater clarity regarding the strengths and changes in resilience among child survivors as they grow and develop (Gray 2012). There are, however, various studies that have examined resilience over time focusing on developmental stages and resiliencies in high risk and maltreated children. Klika and Herrenkohl (2013) provide an in depth review of longitudinal studies spanning developmental stages in maltreated children. Masten (2014) also reviews literature documenting the progress in resilience studies including longitudinal research.

Longitudinal studies address several unique components of resilience that are difficult to assess in traditional cross sectional studies. These include the following:

- When looked at longitudinally, literature suggests that measures of resilience are dynamic (Klika and Herrenkohl 2013). Klika and Herrenkohl review 11 longitudinal studies of maltreated children and suggest, *"the rate of stability in resilience across time is notably low"* (Klika and Herrenkohl 2013: 222). By comparison, cross sectional studies provide only a static picture of resilience. The authors suggest that the variations in study methods coupled with the dynamic nature of resilience make comparisons between studies problematic.
- Werner (1993) discusses the significance of major developmental and life milestones
   (e.g. graduation and marriage) on resilience among Asian American children through to
   adulthood. Werner's assessment suggests "opening up of opportunities" or "major
   turning points" occur in the lives of young adults positively impacting resilience. Werner
   highlights the importance of educational programs, life skills training (military service),
   and active participation in church or a religious community in linking high-risk children /
   now young-adults with those life changing opportunities. A central objective of the
   study documenting how a "chain of protective factors, linked across time," thereby
   protecting children during adversity as they moved through developmental stages
   (Werner 1993: 508). Werner also discusses differences between high-risk males and
   females suggesting internal assets are more important for high-risk men.
- Recent studies describe resilience as a trajectory dynamic and changing over time. These trajectories are impacted by everyday life experiences as well as significant events all linked by time. Masten (2014) reviews several studies, one that uses repeated measures over time to develop a trajectory of internalizing symptoms in child soldiers and highly traumatized youth in Sierra Leone. Unfortunately no studies evaluate similar resiliency trajectories in survivors of sexual abuse.

**2.2 Survivor Vulnerabilities and Risk Factors During (Re-) Integration** Survivors often must cope with multiple vulnerabilities and risk factors during (re-) integration. Sadly many endure re-victimization, whether it is from domestic violence, social exclusion by family members, re-trafficking during migration (Jobe 2010) or a voluntary return to a situation of sexual exploitation (Sandy 2006; 2009; Brunovskis and Surtees 2008). Muco (2013) identifies a number of key risk factors that survivors face during (re-) integration. The first one is an unstable or unfavorable economic environment. When compounded with health problems, this puts the survivor under financial strain. The lack of social acceptance and the presence of stigmatization can go so far as pushing survivors back into situations of victimization. Furthermore, feelings of shame, disappointment with unfulfilled financial obligations to the family, and notions of family honor often burden these already traumatized individuals. Lastly, some survivors must be convinced of the benefit of external support, without which it is quite possible that they may return to a situation of victimization.

<u>Re-trafficking</u> One of the most serious risks faced by survivors is the possibility of being retrafficked. Jobe (2010) discusses this in depth through an analysis of the International Organization for Migration's database on human trafficking. The author found that trafficked children are vulnerable to re-trafficking as adults, that trafficking survivors are most vulnerable during the two years following their exit and that they may be more vulnerable to internal trafficking. Young survivors seem more vulnerable, especially when lack of family support and domestic problems are involved. Of most interest to the present study is the finding that survivors may be at risk when assistance programs have insufficient funding to address the challenges they face, notably the lack of employment, or to assist them for a sufficient length of time. Jobe (2010) further identified certain explanatory factors, many of which are discussed in the following paragraphs.

<u>Converging Push Factors</u> Perhaps the most significant risk factor(s) survivor's face during (re-) integration comes from a converging set of economic, health, and cultural factors. Survivors often (re-) integrate into unstable unfavorable economic environments mixed with mounting financial stressors (such as debt, income lack, unemployment, health problems, and obligations to support extended family). These conditions can and often do converge, dramatically increasing push factors, moving survivors toward re-migration and situations of potential revictimization.

While relating the stories of sex workers in Sihanoukville, Sandy (2006) describes the cultural context of many Cambodian women. In Cambodia, households are often comprised of two or three, sometimes even four generations. Because of the demographic structure and the absence of a social welfare system, the generations that are not economically active must depend on the one in the household that is earning an income. *"Thus, this generation must seek out a wage commensurate with this very high level of financial responsibility"* (Sandy 2006: 462). In this context,

female labor migration for sex work is closely related to notions of filial duty and [...] as a relatively high income earner, sex work is also an integral part of this [...]. The wages women earn from sex work enable them to remit funds home to their families and conserve social norms which dictate that women (and not men) support the family, village and other basic institutions of Cambodian society (Sandy 2006: 460-461).

Sandy dealt here with cases in which Cambodian women voluntarily chose to become indentured sex workers in order to obtain from the brothel owner a loan sufficient to pay for an urgent family crisis. This context helps to better explain why other women might accept to migrate in response to an offer of better job opportunities elsewhere from someone in their social network or why relatives might facilitate such a migration, both being situations which have resulted in trafficking for sexual exploitation. In the face of high family expectations and limited opportunities to achieve "*a sufficiently large level of functionings*" (Duclos and Araar, 2006: 5) in one's own social environment, migration, whether knowingly or unknowingly for sexual exploitation, appears to offer a real chance of widening one's set of capabilities.

Lisborg (2009) designates as risks the very factors that motivate the migration and result in trafficking. In other words, the push factors that cause a survivor to migrate in the first place are

likely to be the primary risk factors they must confront upon (re-) integration. The push factors given by survivors he interviews in Thailand and the Philippines included "family responsibility, economic needs and the pressure of debt, a lack of adequate job options, and a desire for the social status and respect that is gained through affluence. These factors remain the most pressing factors after a woman's return" (Lisborg 2009: 3).

Gozdziak et al. (2006) interviews caseworkers involved in the care and treatment of child survivors of trafficking in the U.S. and found trends that resonate with experiences recorded in Southeast Asia. "Extreme poverty" compounded by "parental illness" or "family breakdowns" is cited as an important push factor toward migration. Often, the survivors decide to migrate in order to financially assist their family or to escape family problems. Information on how to 'migrate' is obtained through their social network; that is to say, through people they believed they could trust. Depending on who offered it, migration is presented as a means of making money or of supporting the parents.

Physical and Mental Health An emerging body of research demonstrates the significant health risks and vulnerabilities survivors of sexual trafficking must confront (Di Tommaso et al. 2009; Hossian et al. 2010; McCauley et al. 2010; Oram et al. 2012). Zimmerman et al. (2011) provides a comprehensive table describing potential abuses endured by survivors of human trafficking and potential corresponding mental and physical health risks (abuses spanned broad categories including physical, emotions, sexual, substance, social, economic, legal, and occupational conditions). The authors also indicate that unfortunately most survivors would return with appreciable health needs. Survey results in Europe show 95% of women are subject to physical and/or sexual violence while trafficked and 57% of women and adolescent survivors report one or more symptoms of poor health (mental and physical) upon arrival at a post-trafficking service center (Zimmerman et al. 2008). In Nepal, girls trafficked under the age of 15 have significantly higher risks of contracting HIV with 60% of the respondents testing positive. In Cambodia, surveys suggest trafficking violence and victimization are also widespread, with 33.1% of women and girls reporting being forced to perform sex acts against their will and 30.9% reporting sexual abuse. In addition, 48 of 73 respondents (65.8%) self-report STI infections, a concerning percentage given the potential for HIV.

There are few studies that evaluated links between physical and mental health problems among survivors. Di Tommaso et al. (2009) found that the well-being deprivation resulting from sexual trafficking is "[a]s bad as it gets" because victims do not have adequate access to medical care and contraception, among other things. A study in Europe of survivors of sexual trafficking links higher levels of Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD), depression, and anxiety with violence and injury (Hossian et al. 2010). Higher levels of PTSD are also associated with sexual violence. Higher levels of depression and anxiety are linked to more time spent in trafficking. Depression and anxiety levels decline with time spent away from trafficking but PTSD did not. Collectively these studies identify significant health risks that survivors confront through the (re-) integration process.

Social Acceptance, Stigma, and Family Shame Family shame is an important risk factor with regards to (re-) integration in South East Asia. In Nepal, Simkhada (2008) found that survivors, upon (re-) integration, often face overwhelming difficulties because social stigma, perceptions of family honor, and family repudiation leaves them with "no hope for a dignified life", especially when they return home indebted, sick or without money to help their family (Simkhada 2008: 243-246). Crawford and Kaufman (2008) describe the stigma surrounding prostitution as so strong that the presence of a survivor in the community is perceived as bringing shame not only upon her family, but also the whole community. In Cambodia, Derks (1998) explained that shame is related to social behavioral norms regarding young women's departure from their village, the sexual nature of the work they were involved in, and whether they made a positive or negative contribution to their family. If the young woman returns with illness her family sees her as having brought shame upon it. Because of survivors' awareness of the perceptions regarding prostitution, even when it has been forced, they feel shame and therefore, do not discuss their experience much with their family after their return. And even when families have suspicions, they usually do not ask questions. This is seen as facilitating a return to normalcy and preserving the perceived honor of the family, but leaves survivors isolated and without support.

Trafficking and Collusion Initiated by the Family Family involvement in trafficking increases the probability of re-trafficking after reintegration into the family. In some cases, this creates a tension between the intervening NGO and the survivors' family. McCauley et al. 2010 reported that families participated in trafficking decisions in nearly one third (29.2%) of the young women respondents in Cambodia. Derks (1998) describes a case in which the eldest daughter, still a minor, of a Vietnamese family living in Cambodia is sold by her mother three times, twice after family (re-) integration, in order to obtain loans from the brothel owner. The mother is sent to prison for trafficking and the children come under an NGO's care. The child's siblings blame her for their mother's imprisonment. Moreover, as Steinfatt (2003) discusses, interventions that rescue the eldest daughter of a Vietnamese family, who is held responsible to work off her family's debt in Cambodia, will likely result in a younger daughter being sent in her stead to uphold the family's obligation to reimburse its debt. As a result, in such cases, reunification with family constitutes a serious risk that leaves NGOs with the challenge of finding an alternative viable solution.

**Psychological Barriers From Trauma** Child survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking face numerous potential psychological barriers as they recover and (re-) integrate into the community. Gajic-Veljanoski and Stewart (2007) discuss the psychological barriers to escaping trafficking for sexual exploitation, especially when in its most extreme forms. Because traffickers may and do resort to intimidation, manipulation, marginalization, and various forms of abuse to gain control over victims, these elements become barriers to exiting victimization. A survivor's cultural background may also predispose them to endure quietly or to believe that they cannot obtain justice and compensation in a corrupt context. Internal psychological barriers mentioned by these authors include: cognitive dissonance, hopelessness, ingrained cultural norms of gender behavior, sense of responsibility to repay debts, sense of responsibility for own

victimization, low self-worth, dissociation, and apathy. Finally, where family indebtedness or family honor is involved, victims face family pressure, rejection, even violence. Abu-Ali and Al-Bahar (2011) explore therapeutic models for the treatment of the personal and interpersonal effects that child survivors experience. They emphasize that if such consequences are not addressed, child survivors may well fall into further victimization and reenter the trafficking cycle. Some of the symptoms that are documented include anxiety, depression, distrust, social isolation, splitting, dissociation, and attachment disruptions. These all constitute psychological barriers to escaping sexual trafficking, although not all of these elements equally affect survivors.

**Refusal of (Re-) Integration Assistance** Survivors may also be at risk when they refuse assistance. In some situations, earning money remains a major preoccupation for survivors, either for family support or to reimburse the cost of migration. This priority is identified as being likely to conflict with their willingness to receive care and to acquire an education (Gozdziak et al. 2006). The authors also report that some of the survivors did not see themselves as having been victims, nor their traffickers as being perpetrators. Brunovskis and Surtees (2012a) identify similar concerns as well as a number of additional factors contributing to a survivor's decision to refuse assistance. Victims may consider migration as their best option to make much-needed money, even when this exposes them to risk. Family pressure to return home may also influence their decision to decline. In some cases, they do not need trafficking assistance because they have access to other forms of support. Victims sometimes refuse because of insufficient information about the services provided by the assistance program, because the program cannot respond to their particular needs, and because they see programs as being too restrictive. Finally, some victims decline because they distrust the assistance that is proposed to them, fearing stigma and exclusion once they are identified as trafficking victims.

#### 2.3 (Re-) Integration in Cambodia

(Re-) integration assistance programs are generally organized in three phases of support. The goal of the first phase is to address all urgent needs survivors may have, to assess survivors' physical and psychological health, and to offer a stable and safe environment where survivors may recover. The goal of phase two is a gradual return toward independence, sometimes through housing outside the center. The goal of phase three is to ensure a smooth (re-) integration into the family and community, referral to helpful resources, and finally, temporary monitoring and follow-up (Muco 2013). This is consistent with the advice given in the IOM handbook (IOM 2007: 84-104), although modalities vary between programs.

Besides these usual components, the NGOs in Cambodia that have been participating in the Butterfly Project also evaluate a number of factors that may impact on survivors' (re-) integration<sup>5</sup>. Some assess the survivors' skills to generate an income. All of them count the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>Partnering Assistance Programs vary in their understanding and descriptions of the (re-) integration process in the Butterfly Project. One practitioner described (re-) integration as an individual experience in Miles and Miles, 2010 as follows:

number of adults in the house where the survivor is to be reintegrated who are generating an income. Most of them also provide money or items to survivors upon (re-) integration to help them start a business. The majority of NGOs also monitor the level of indebtedness within the survivors' households. Moreover, all assess survivors' concerns about being accepted back into their communities (Miles and Miles 2010).

#### (Re-) Integration Challenges

Even when they possess all the usual components and strive to integrate the improvements proposed above, (re-) integration programs are still left with a number of challenges to overcome. Some of these are internal, pertaining to their design or implementation, but others are external, and in some cases, much more complex to address.

One of the challenges faced by assistance programs is to ensure the safety of the women and children under their care while helping them recover their independence. The tension between these is discussed by Brunovskis and Surtees (2008), who focuses on the tendency of these programs to place survivors in closed or hidden shelters, restrict their movement, and monitor their communications with the outside world. These features are based on understandings of what sexual exploitation and trafficking are, of what victims are and of what rehabilitated survivors should be. The authors call attention to the danger that such security components may infantilize the survivors, limit their agency rather than helping them to regain it, and affect their recovery by reducing their ability to negotiate, dissent, and resist.

Another challenge examined by these authors is helping survivors (re-) integrate into their families (Brunovskis and Surtees, 2012b). This is a crucial issue because the family can help in the survivor's recovery by providing the proper support and may even prevent re-trafficking. However, frequently tensions arise between a returning survivor and her family due mainly to a lack of communication. The family is often partially or completely unaware of what the survivor has been through. This is especially the case when the survivor fears stigma, rejection, and even violence. She may choose not to disclose her experience at all. This generates misunderstandings on both sides and tensions.

Surtees (2012 and 2013) explores the challenges (re-) integration programs face in Southeast Asia helping survivors become economically empowered. The quest for improved economic opportunities is both an important push factor and an enduring concern for survivors and their families. Most (re-) integration programs seek to address this through job placement, micro businesses, and social enterprises. The challenges programs face in job placement include limited available employment and survivors' limited skills. Psychological effects survivors must cope with may also complicate their job placement. Micro businesses and social enterprises provide a safe work environment and improve survivors' status within their family, however,

<sup>&</sup>quot;...(re -) integration is not a single event, it's a process. ...we begin the process of preparation for (re-) integration from the moment the girls walk through the doors.....(re-) integration continues long after the girls will experience new issues that require constant adjustment and processing." Butterfly partnering Practitioner, 2010

these also carry risks. According to Surtees, of the above options are conditioned by the following factors: 1) individual characteristics and capacities; 2) family situation and dynamics; 3) the broader social environment; 4) the general economic situation; and 5) other needs impacting re/integration success (Surtees 2012). This report advises (re-) integration programs to carefully consider all these aspects while seeking to empower survivors.

Economic opportunities for underage survivors may be beneficial, but need to be assessed based on the best interests of the child (Surtees 2012). Literature defines children's work as a means by which children in certain contexts position themselves within their socio-cultural environment (Boyden and Mann 2005). As pointed out by Gozdziak et al. (2006), children and youth who have been rescued from sexual trafficking do not lose the sense of responsibility to help their families financially by earning money. The socio-cultural advantages and disadvantages children and youth might perceive from working, even if it is in the commercial sex sector, must be taken into account and healthy income-generating alternatives need to be carefully designed as part of assistance programming. Although sex work (whether voluntary or not) is denigrated in Cambodia, the higher income it earns is not and may indeed create family expectations. Assistance programs must find ways to help survivors mediate the stigma, continued family expectations and their own sense of filial duty.

In addition to challenges facing (re-) integration programs, research identifies certain key factors that have a positive effect on the (re-) integration process. Muco (2013) distinguishes four points affecting the (re-) integration process. The support provided by state institutions affects survivors' access to a number of services they urgently need. A tolerant attitude on the part of the community facilitates the survivor's adjustments back into it. A network of NGOs and religious organizations providing a wide range of services helps respond to survivors' most urgent needs. Finally, the motivation of the survivor herself contributes to (re-) integration success. Hotaling et al. (2003) call attention to the benefits of integrating peer support into programs reaching out to women exiting prostitution. If the survivor is returning from a migration attempt, the failure to return with money or the presence of debt adds to the stress of the situation. Brunovskis and Surtees (2012b) conclude that assisting the family of the survivor as well as the survivor could facilitate this transition period, which is trying for all involved. Jobe (2010) provides a similar recommendation suggesting that the provision of assistance to survivors span longer periods of time, not only through internationally funded assistance programs, but also through the gradual development of local and national infrastructures.

#### 3.0 Study Scope and Methods

This thematic paper is based upon the data collected and analyzed from the Butterfly Longitudinal (Re-) integration Research Project. The Butterfly Project began in 2010 and by December 2014 it will have completed its fifth year. Details regarding the study methods, changes in methods from year to year, ethically standards followed, data collection tools and techniques, and strengths and weakness of the methodologies chosen are available in the project annual reports (see Miles and Miles 2010; Miles and Miles 2011; Miles et al. 2012; Miles et al. 2013).

At the midway point in the larger study, the team chose to conduct a baseline case study analysis on each participant. Four-plus years of quantitative and qualitative data are compiled and summarized to grasp what is known, contradictory, and missing from each participant's story. The case study analyses resulted in qualitative summary data from 86 participants and survey response data from 128 participants. These data form the starting pool of all available data for the thematic assessment.

Table 1 summarizes these data. A total of 1,070 project visits for 128 participants are included in the data set. A total of 613 visits are conducted with respondents in various NGO residential programs [described hereafter as shelter programs (SP)] and 457 visits are conducted with those (re-) integrated in the community (also referred to as RC). There are three general categories for respondents after (re-) integration including 59 individuals that are part of NGO (re-) integration programs, 24 that are part of NGO work assistance and training programs, and 37 that are no longer in NGO programs [(re-) integration complete].

Data for the thematic assessment are broken down into four categories. The assessment includes cohort data only if the case study showed at least four visits for a cohort spanning at least two calendar years. For the assessment, participants are divided into four groups based on gender and whether or not they lived in a shelter program for at least 4-months prior to re-entry in the community. They include:

- 1. Female SP females in shelter programs that have not yet (re-) integrated (N=32),
- Female SP/RC females that stayed in shelter programs and have already (re-) integrated (N=34),
- 3. Female RC females that did not stay in shelter programs and have (re-) integrated (N=28), and
- 4. Male SP/RC males that stayed in shelter programs and have already (re-) integrated (N=15).

There are also three male participants in the overall study that are in shelter programs but have not (re-) integrated in the community. Due to the small sample size, these data are not included in the assessment. Tables 2 and 3 summarize the data set categories used in the thematic evaluation. The assessment utilizes four years of data compiled from 994 total interviews involving 109 study participants.

Summary of			Re-integration	
Cohort Individuals 2011 to 2014	Total	NGO Follow- up Services	Assistance Training or Work	Complete No Services
Residental Program Only	40	0	0	0
Residental Program and				
Re-integration into Community	54	47	2	17
Community Only <sup>1</sup>	34	12	22	20
Total	128	59	24	37

Table 1: Survivor Cohort Summary Statistics, 2011-2014

Notes: 1- Includes 15 women that spent <4 months in the shelter program before re-integration.

Number of			<b>Re-integration</b>	
Cohort Visits 2011 to 2014	Total	NGO Follow- up Services	Assistance Training or Work	Complete No Services
Residental Program Only	329	0	0	0
Residental Program and				
Re-integration into Community <sup>1</sup>	486	166	3	33
Community Only	255	22	137	80
Total	1070	188	140	113

Notes: 1-Residental Program Visits -284

Re-integration Community Visits - 202

Table 2: Male	e and Fema	le Survivor	Cohort	Summ	ar	y١	Us	ed	in	th	e,	Ass	sess	me	nt,	201	1-2	014	,
										-		-							4

Summary of		Individuals Re-integrating						
Cohorts 2011 to 2014	Total Number	NGO Follow-up Services	Assistance Training or Work	Complete No Services				
		Female						
Female SP	32	0	0	0				
Female RC <sup>1</sup>	28	7	22	18				
Female SP/RC	34	31	2	11				
Summary All Female	94	38	24	29				
		Male						
Male SP/RC	15	13	0	3				

Notes: 1- Includes 15 women that spent <4 months in the shelter program before re-integration.

SP-Shelter Program

RC - Re-integrated into Community

SP/RC - Shelter Program then Re-integrated into Community

Number of		Re-integration					
Cohort Visits 2011 to 2014	Total	NGO Follow- up Services	Assistance Training or Work	Complete No Services			
		Female					
Female SP	296	0	0	0			
Female RC <sup>1</sup>	239	15	137	76			
Female SP/RC <sup>2</sup>	315	108	3	24			
Summary All Female	850	123	140	100			
		Male					
Male SP/RC <sup>3</sup>	144	53	0	5			

Table 3: Male and Female Survivor Cohort Visits Used in the Assessment, 2011-2014

Notes: 1-Included 11 visits at residental programs in 2011

2-Residental Program Visits - 180

Re-integration Community Visits - 135

3-Residental Program Visits - 86

Re-integration Community Visits - 58

SP-Shelter Program

RC - Re-integrated into Community

SP/RC - Shelter Program then Re-integrated into Community

Relevant summary data as well as detailed responses are compiled in the assessment as they relate to several basic themes within the overall study. These include participants' responses, attitudes, perceptions and experiences relating to 'trust', 'relationships', 'debt', 'stigma and discrimination', and 'violence'. Responses to several general questions posed in the survey pertaining to well-being and thoughts regarding (re-) integration are also included in the assessment. These questions are compiled in Figure 1. Narrative responses from individual participants are combined into the year the interview is conducted. In this way, individual assessment years are constructed for participants over four calendar years in which data were collected (2011-2014). These data are then used in the thematic assessment.

Figure 1: List of Research Survey Questions Used in the Assessment

- Q9a. Why did you feel it was your responsibility to repay debt during the past four months?
- Q10. In past four months, do you feel a person/some people (anyone) have discriminated against you?
- Q10a. Who discriminated against you?
- Q11a. Who has treated you respectfully in the past four months?
- Q11b. Why do you to feel some people have been respectful towards you?
- Q12. Over the last four months, have you had someone in your life that you feel you can trust?
- Q12a. Who do you feel you can trust the most?
- Q13a. Who(m) has/have been you physically violent towards you?
- Q13b. Please describe more about this situation when you experienced physical violence towards you
- Q14a. Who (whom-can be more than one person) was emotional violent to you?
- Q14b. Please describe more about this situation when you experienced physical violence towards you.
- Q28. Have you been responsible to repay debt in past year?
- Q28d. Has being responsible to repay debt affected your life in any way in the past year?
- Q39. How do you feel relations between yourself and people in your community *(outside of the shelter)* have changed in the past year overall?
- Q40. Do you feel generally accepted by the community *(outside of the shelter)* where your household is located at this present time?
- Q41. Do you agree with the following statement? In the past year, 'I feel I am (re-) integrating well into my community where my residence *(outside of the shelter)* is located.'
- Q42. In past year, have you experienced discrimination?
- Q43a. From whom have you experienced discrimination in past year?
- Q43b. If yes, what do you think is the reason this person discriminated against you?
- Q44. From whom did you access help to deal with discrimination in this past year?
- Q45. How did the experience of being discriminated against make you feel?
- Q62. How have you felt emotionally during the past four months compared to the same time period last year?
- Q63. Have you felt generally happier or sadder during this past year?
- Q64. Have you generally felt more contented or more worried during this past year?
- Q65. Have you had 'other' feelings (other than happy, sad, contented and worried) during this past year?
- Q80a. Do you feel you have been pressured to have sex when you did not want to in this past year?
- Q81c. Do you feel you have been sexually exploited in the past year?

#### 4.0 Results and Discussion

General statistics for the four different assessment groups are outlined in Table 4. Participants' average age at the beginning of the study is lowest in the Male SP/RC group (12.9 years old) followed closely by the Female SP group at 14.3 years old. Generally, the female groups include participants that started in the study as children/teenagers (Female SP), teenagers transitioning to young adults (Female SP/RC), and young adults/adults (Female RC). The Female RC groups have the widest age range of 20 years while the Male SP/RC have the narrowest age range spanning seven years. The total number of individual years assessed is determined by adding together the number of calendar years evaluated for each individual. Longitudinal data generally spans three to four consecutive years for groups that are exclusively in a shelter or in the community (i.e. Female SP and Female RC). Longitudinal data for SP/RC participants are spilt with the majority of survivors spending one to two years in each category, shelter and community. While all participants in Female SP/RC start in a shelter program and transition sometime during the course of the assessment, there are cases when individuals provided little or no qualitative discussion data and therefore no data are recorded for shelter or community categories (Table 4). This situation occurred with seven of the 34 individuals in this group.

		Total	Total Number of individual		Count of Individuals by the Number of Years Included in Longitudinal Assessment Shelter Community 1 2 3 4 0 1 2 3 4 0 1 6 14 11									
Assessment	Starti	ng Ages	Number of	Years		S	helt	er			Con	nmu	nity	1
Groups	Range	Average	Individuals	Assessed	0	1	2	3	4	0	1	2	3	4
Female SP	7-20	14.3	32	99	0	1	6	14	11			NA		
Female RC	16-36	24.6	28	84			NA			0	0	8	12	8
Female SP/RC	13-21	17	34	60/51	2	11	15	5	1	5	13	10	6	0
Male SP/RC	10-17	12.9	15	29 / 30	0	6	5	3	1	0	3	9	3	0

Notes: NA - Not Applicable

SP-Shelter Program

RC - Re-integrated into Community

SP/RC - Shelter Program then Re-integrated into Community

#### 4.1 Survivor Milestones and Transitions <sup>6</sup>

The longitudinal assessment follows participants through several important societal milestones and transitions (Figure 2). While the data spans only the first four years, almost all the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The Oxford dictionary defines 'Milestone' as a "significant stage or event in the development of something".

http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/milestone. In this paper we consider major life milestones to include events such as getting married, graduating from school, job training, and/or experiencing pregnancy or having a child. According to the Oxford dictionary 'Transition' is defined as "The process or a period of changing from one state or condition to another." http://www.oxforddictionaries.com/definition/english/transition. In this paper we consider 'transitions' to include important life changes a person such as reaching young adulthood and (re-) integration for survivors.

participants will reach young adulthood (or older) over the ten-year study time frame. Based on the average starting ages of the assessment groups, the majority of women in the Female SP/RC are now moving through this transition. In the youngest average age groups, Female SP and Male SP/RC, many survivors have yet to reach this transition; while everyone in the Female RC group reached young adult ages or higher over the last four years. Maturing, making decisions regarding life and relationships, and learning to live independently are topics survivors discuss during the transition.





There are other transitions happening as well. Survivors are re-entering schools or joining job training programs while a part of shelter programs and then leaving/graduating from schools and various NGO work and training programs to find employment in the community. Transitions away from job training and schools are generally complex with decisions based on a set of factors that pushed and pulled survivors and their families. Almost all participants began school, although among respondents in 2011, the highest percentage report only finishing Year 1 and Year 2 for male and female participants, respectively. No one in the study in 2011 completed high school. Yet when asked if they would choose to study further if they could, almost all responded favorably with 98% of female respondents and 96% of male respondents identifying various levels of education in school or skills training programs. The struggle to balance this desire to study and learn with the need to work and earn money are common themes discussed by survivors as they move through this life transition.

Marriage is an important societal milestone that most participants have not reached yet. Based on the full assessment year in 2013, 50% (14 individuals) of the Female RC group are married or in long-term partnerships (Table 5). Among the Female SP/RC group, only 15% (5 individuals) are married or with partners and no Male SP/RC participants are married or with partners. These findings are not unexpected; given the average age difference of almost seven years between female groups (see Table 2) and the fact that participants (re-) integrating from shelter programs are single upon re-entry. When asked, almost all female survivors express at one time the desire to be married to an honest and supportive husband and start a family. This transition, however, is also complex and often difficult for survivors to navigate; to do so they must confront cultural stigmas, meet family expectations, and merge differing generational viewpoints that can often add to the complexity. Important issues such as starting relationships, arranged marriages by family members and others, long-term partners, trusting boyfriends and their family's enough to share about past life experiences, pregnancy, and blending families are often discussed by survivors.

		-		
2013	Female SP	Female RC	Female SP/RC	Male SP/RC
single	100%	50%	85%	100%
married / partner		50%	15%	

Table 5: Percent of Survivors Single or Married/Partners in 2013

There are also several important transitions discussed by survivors as they move from life in a shelter program to life in the community (Figure 3). Participants very often discuss friendships when asked questions about people they could trust and people that had treated them respectfully in the last year. Almost everyone discusses friendships at least one time over the course of the assessment while living in shelter programs and in the community. Participants also describe situations involving attentive shelter staff that provided guidance and counsel (sometimes counseling as well) to create an environment that fosters and nurtures friendships. Descriptions of supportive friendships are slightly different depending on the age of the participant; with younger participants speaking of friendships because peers played with them while older participants (e.g. young adults) suggesting supportive friends are peers that share food and resources (money) during times of shortage. Female respondents also describe difficulty in making friendships in the community, particularly if discriminating people are present and aware of their past history.



Figure 3: (Re-) Integration Transitions for Survivors in Shelter Programs

Participants living in shelters often discuss having normal everyday conflicts such as arguments, disagreements, and differing viewpoints among their shelter peers (Figure 3). Again, members

of the shelter staff are frequently described as being involved in handling conflicts, especially more significant or longer-term disputes. In contrast, conflicts in the community often involve family, neighbors, co-workers, or schoolmates. Sometimes participants in the shelter programs also describe a greater understanding of the processes involved in resolving and navigating conflicts. These types of discussions are far more rare for participants (re-) integrated in the community. If they did occur, they are related to an NGO follow-up program or a work assistance-training program. Typically participants in shelters transition out of programs that emphasized a safe and accepting environment and then have to transition into communities that are stigmatizing discriminating toward survivors of sexual trafficking. Generally this transition is more difficult for those participants with family problems, strained family relationships, or discriminating family members.

As survivors navigate these transitions and reach these life milestones they are asked to reflect on feelings of personal well-being (Table 6). Three themes are explored and discussed including being worried about major aspects of life now or in the immediate future, the understanding that life in the shelter is good for their well-being physically, intellectually, emotionally, and/or socially, and expressions of contentment, happiness, and satisfaction about major aspects of life such as personal security, family relationships, and financial earnings.

Participants express worry about life while in shelter programs and after (re-) integration in the community (Table 6). Worries in the shelter include concerns over family members who are sick or hungry at home, concerns regarding (re-) integration and the difficulties they may face back home, concerns about studies / school, and concerns over court cases, particularly if they involve family members. Those that have already (re-) integrated tend to worry more about balancing life as it related to sickness, debt, earning enough to survive while in school/training, unemployment, and children. Many of participants express that life in the shelter programs is good for them, particularly the youngest group, Female SP. Many noted the love they receive from staff and shelter moms, as well as the stability and security the home provides (food, medical care, and a good place to live). After (re-) integration many survivors remark, as they readjusted, that life is more difficult outside the shelter. About 33% of the Female and Male SP/RC express this as they reflected on their current living arrangements. Both groups (in the shelter programs and (re-) integrated) express feeling satisfied and happy with various aspects of life. In fact more survivors in the Female SP/RC group express feeling satisfied and content after re-uniting with their family in the community. Participants describe their experiences as follows:

- ⇒ I am happy but a little tired compared to the time I stayed in the shelter because I had to go to school and after coming back from school, I had to do household work and look after my younger siblings. -Female Survivor, Age 19, 2013
- ⇒ All of my salary I give to my mother. I am happy and feel proud of myself that I can work to support my family. -Female Survivor, Age 20, 2014

## ⇒ I am content now because I have enough money and I don't experience domestic violence. -Female Survivor, Age 24, 2013

		Shelter							
		Wor	ried	Shelte	r Life	Feeling S	atisfied		
		About	t Life	Good f	ior Me	and H	арру		
	Total		Total		Total		Total		
Assessment	Number of	Number of	Comment	Number of	Comment	Number of	Comment		
Groups	Individuals	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts		
Female SP	32	12	17	23	40	8	10		
Female SP/RC	34	14	15	8	10	4	7		
Male SP/RC	15	4	6	9	17	3	3		
				Comm	unity				
		Wor	Worried Life Difficult Feeling			Feeling S	atisfied		
		About	About Life Outside Shelter and			and H	арру		
	Total		Total		Total		Total		
Assessment	Number of	Number of	Comment	Number of	Comment	Number of	Comment		
Groups	Individuals	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts		
Female RC	28	19	28	0	0	8	11		
Female SP/RC	34	17	22	11	13	12	13		

#### Table 6: Survivor Expressions of Re-integration and Personal Well-Being, 2011-2014

Notes: SP-Shelter Program

RC - Re-integrated into Community SP/RC - Shelter Program then Re-integrated into Community

Participants transitioning to young adults and (re-) integrating in the community often describe risky behaviors and preferences for higher risk life situations. As a result the study identified decision-making surrounding seven commonly discussed themes for participants while living in shelter programs and following (re-) integration. Themes surrounding high-risk behaviors and life situations include the following:

- 1. Drugs / Alcohol using illegal drugs or drinking alcohol in excess to cope with difficult life situations
- 2. Staying in a Violent Relationship staying in violent personal relationship with friends, boyfriends, or spouses
- 3. Relationship choosing to start long-term relationships with people they did not know well (often less than one year) and/ or met while working in the sex industry or through friends that are part of the sex industry (karaoke bars and entertainment clubs)
- 4. Potential Family Stigma and Violence choosing to carry-on sexual relationships with boyfriends and partners with family disapproval and despite their own understanding that this relationship and a potential pregnancy could bring community stigma, family shame, and physical abuse from family members
- 5. Employment migrating to another country for employment and remaining there without legal status or taking a job in the sex industry but not choosing to do sex work

- 6. Personal Health inflicting self-harm (i.e. cutting) and refusing to eat when food is available
- 7. Sex Work choosing to go back into sex work

As expected survivors in the shelter programs discuss fewer high-risk circumstances and behaviors and also express fewer decisions toward or away from these situations (Table 7). By their basic function and mandate, shelters programs work to prevent/control many of these higher risk situations including decision making by survivors inside the shelter. Participants often allude to this as they describe their living conditions, stating the shelter staff or the shelter rules are "strict" and that sometimes they had "few personal freedoms". These statements generally arose during reflections when participants move to transition homes or back into the community. Nevertheless, some participants describe choosing higher risk behaviors and life situations while in shelter and a female survivor describes spending time with friends outside the shelter and a female survivor describes spending time with friends outside the shelter that would "get drunk and beat her". In each of these cases shelters staff intervened in the situation to protect the individuals and provide them additional help / resources.

	Total Comment Counts for Higher Risk Behaviors and Life Situations					
	Shelter (SP)		Community (SP/RC)		Community (RC)	
Assessment Themes	Toward	Away From	Toward	Away From	Toward	Away From
drugs/alcohol	2	1	8	0	5	0
staying in violent						
relationship	1	0	5	1	4	1
relationship	2	0	3	1	4	3
potential family						
stigma and violence	0	0	2	1	7	0
employment	0	0	2	3	6	3
personal health	2	0	4	0	1	1
sex work	0	0	1	0	5	1

Table 7: Survivor Decision Making Regarding Higher Risk Behaviors and Situations, 2011-2014

Notes: All groups combined to Shelter (N=79), Community SP/RC (N=44), and Community RC (N=28)

Once survivors (re-) integrate, decision-making and the structures or parental figures that helped guide these processes shift back to families and/or the individuals themselves. Some of the younger participants already (re-) integrated (Male and Female SP/RC) describe parental figures participating in this process by allowing them more or less personal freedoms. Generally among the SP/RC groups, more male participants struggle to make good decisions regarding drugs/alcohol while more female participants struggle with choices in relationships and
domestic violence. Participants in the Female RC group describe making high-risk decisions on their own (e.g. choosing relationships with men), to cope with difficult situations (e.g. alcohol use to cope with domestic violence), or sometimes with the help of a close friend (e.g. returning to sex work) or their husband (e.g. migrating to find employment in Thailand). In general, participants in the community express more high-risk decision making surrounding relationships, domestic violence, and family stigma and violence based on relationship choices.

# 4.2 Relationships

Family relationships and living arrangements within family units are typically complex and varied. Survivors describe numerous different household arrangements including: marriages, partnerships, many combinations of nuclear and extended family, foster families, child headed households, single parent families, living with one's in-laws, and blended families. The family make-up of households and family units often change after participants (re-) integrated. Almost no participant describes staying with the same family unit over three or four years. The following story by one survivor in 2013 exemplifies the blending and changing nature of her family unit during one year:

- ⇒ I live with my stepmother, father, and older sister. My stepmother and I don't get along together. She is always making conflicts and arguing with me. My father got in a traffic accident and injured his hand. I will go to live with my real mother in the province because she called and asked me to live there.
- ⇒ I wanted to move out with my cousin. Some of my neighbors are very violent towards my family. They yelled at my little siblings and hit my Aunt.
- ⇒ I moved to live in a rental room with my older sister and cousin. I wanted to earn money to help my older sister support us because she was the only one working. I tried working in a nightclub quit because it was not a good job. I could find other work.
- ⇒ I moved back to live with my father, he asked me to come back home. My father didn't want me to live alone. My older sister married and moved out to live with her husband.
   I still don't get along with my stepmother. –Female Survivor, Age 16, 2013

Similar to the dynamics seen in the make-up of family units, participants' experiences and perceptions of close personal relationships within the family are complex, changing, and diverse. Many of the younger participants describe their experiences with their own family as well as their extended family. Older teenagers, young adults, and adults discuss relationships with their own families, boyfriends and partners, husbands, long-term partners, and children. Through the course of this assessment, some describe how personal relationships end and new ones develop. A few participants spoke about how they felt having their engagements and marriages arranged for them. A greater number spoke about choosing their partner, with, or without their parents' consent. Other women describe some of the challenges they face with polygamy, infidelity, and domestic violence.

Survivors express both positive and negative family relationships over the course of the study (Table 8). Among participants in the shelter programs between 2011 and 2014, fewer than 35% in any assessment group chose to discuss positive or negative feelings regarding family relationships (Table 8). Discussion questions include their thoughts and feelings about trust, being respected, discrimination, and emotional and physical violence as well as questions regarding their thoughts and feelings of happiness/sadness and contentment/ worry over the past year. For those participants that did discuss family relationships while in shelter programs, the majority of individuals indicate a positive relationship with at least one family member. Results range from 13% to 33% of the individuals among assessment groups expressing a positive relationships, three and two individuals for Female SP and Female SP/RC, respectively. Further, no male survivor living in the shelter programs express a negative relationship with family members while addressing the aforementioned questions over all years combined.

		Shelter			
		Positive	Family	Negative Family	
		Relatio	nship	Relationship	
	Total		Total		Total
Assessment	Number of	Number of	Comment	Number of	Comment
Groups	Individuals	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts
Female SP	32	4	7	3	5
Female SP/RC	34	8	10	2	4
Male SP/RC	15	5	5	0	0
			Comn	nunity	
		Positive		nunity Negative	Family
		Positive Relatio	Family		
	Total		Family	Negative	
Assessment		Relatio	Family nship Total	Negative	nship Total
Assessment Groups	Number of	Relatio	Family nship Total	Negative Relatio	nship Total
	Number of	Relatio Number of	Family nship Total Comment	Negative Relatio	nship Total Comment
Groups	Number of Individuals	Relatio Number of Individuals	Family nship Total Comment Counts	Negative Relatio Number of Individuals	nship Total Comment Counts

Table 8: Total Counts and Individuals Expressing Positive and Negative Family Relationships, 2011-2014

Notes: SP-Shelter Program

RC - Re-integrated into Community

SP/RC - Shelter Program then Re-integrated into Community

Participants (re-) integrated in the community describe noticeably more positive and negative family relationships as compared to participants in shelter programs (Table 8). Among community assessment groups, 67% of the individuals in Male SP/RC, 74% of the individuals in Female SP/RC, and 82% of the individuals in Female RC discuss positive, negative, or mixed relationships (both positive and negative) with family members during the study. Positive, negative, or mixed family relationships are expressed in 53%, 58%, and 62% of the individual assessment years (see Table 4 for individual assessment years) for Male SP/RC, Female RC, and Female SP/RC, respectively. Among community assessment groups 43% to 53% of individuals express positive relationships, while 33% to 53% of individuals discuss negative relationships. Among the Female SP/RC and Female RC groups, negative family relationships are expressed in 35% (18 of the possible 51 individual years) and 38% (32 of the possible 84 individual years) of the total number of assessment years, respectively.

Participants discuss a wide range of family members contributing to positive and negative family relationships (Table 9). Participants in shelter programs and those reintegrated from shelter programs cite their mothers most often in positive and negative relationships. Participants in the shelter programs tend to express fewer negative family relationships with only nine instances compared to 38 instances for individuals in the community. Female RC participants identify husbands and partners most often followed by relationships with mother/father in laws. These categories, husband / partner and mother / father in law, also account for the majority of negative family relationships within the Female RC group.

	Total Comment Counts for Family Relationships						
	Shelter (SP)		Community (SP/RC)		Community (RC)		
Assessment Themes	Positive	Negative	Positive	Negative	Positive	Negative	
mother	12	4	13	14	7	1	
spouse / partner	0	0	5	6	16	30	
father	4	0	6	2	2	1	
sister	2	1	3	0	0	2	
brother	3	0	2	0	0	0	
parents of spouse / partner	0	0	3	4	1	10	
extended family	0	1	2	6	2	3	
foster family	0	0	4	0	0	0	
inlaw relative	0	0	1	3	0	0	
step father or mother	0	0	0	3	0	0	
children in law	0	0	0	0	0	2	

Table 9: Total Counts for Family Relationships Expressed by Survivors within Shelter and Community, 2011-2014

Notes: All groups combined to Shelter (N=79), Community SP/RC (N=44), and Community RC (N=28)

These findings highlight an important socio-cultural split between participant groups that have already (re-) integrated in the community. Generally, survivors in the Female RC group identify positive and negative relationships within the family units they have formed with their boyfriends / partners or spouses (Figure 4). The high count of negative relationships with spouses and their parents indicates a substantial number of participants are struggling in these relationships. Within the Female RC group, 19 indicate they were or still are married or involved in long-term relationships. Of these 19 participants, 15 describe a negative relationship with their boyfriend or spouse and/or his parents over their last year interviewed. Nine of these participants recount negative conditions for two or more consecutive years (Figure 4). The majority describe living with their in laws at some point after marriage and spoke of the difficulty adjusting to their new family unit. While some participants share their life history with their husbands, almost all kept this a secret from their parents in law. Unfortunately many participants describe enduring years of alcohol related physical violence, emotional abuse, physical threats, infidelity, drug addiction, and abandonment by their husbands or boyfriends and the family in law (Table 10). In their own words:

- ⇒ I was deceived again and again by men. I did not want to have another relationship with a man because all of these love experiences make me broken hearted and my heart aches very much. -Female Survivor, Age 23, 2013
- ⇒ My husband seemed like a good and honest man. However, I was wrong. My husband is jealous toward me if I talk to another man or dress up in nice clothes to make myself look good. He has also started to stay out with other girls at the restaurants at night and has lied to me. -Female Survivor, Age 29, 2013
- ⇒ Every night I cannot sleep unless I drink alcohol because I feel depressed with my husband, as he often does not come home and when he does he is violent toward me.
   –Female Survivor, Age 33, 2012



Family problems and troubled relationships are also a common and often consistent theme year to year with both female and male participants (re-) integrating from the shelter programs (Female and Male SP/RC). These groups appear more willing to discuss their family problems in the shelters, without indicating whether or not they have a negative relationship with their families (Table 10). Once (re-) integrated, female participants often describe conflicts with their family stemming from disagreements over relationships with boyfriends / partners and arranged marriages. In some instances, survivors put themselves at risk of family related violence because of their choices to continue personal and intimate relationships without their family's approval (either their own family or their boyfriend's family).

⇒ I am pregnant with my boyfriend. My boyfriend's family knows and they refused to accept our unborn baby and me. They wanted me to abort our child. I feel very brokenhearted and at the same time afraid of my parents. My parents will physically beat me if they know that I am pregnant. Moreover, if my neighbors know that I am pregnant they will look down on me because this brings shame to my family. -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2012

	Total Comment Counts for Family Problems				
Assessment Themes	Shelter (SP)	Community (SP/RC)	Community (RC)		
multiple conflicts and violence	13	13	3		
alcohol related violence	4	6	8		
human trafficking	6	5	2		
gambling debt	7	3	2		
death of father/mother	4	3	3		
neighbor conflicts and violence	0	2	0		
drugs	0	0	1		
infidelity	0	0	1		

Table 10: Total Count of Family Problems Expressed by Survivors within Shelter and Community, 2011-2014

Notes: All groups combined to Shelter (N=79), Community SP/RC (N=44), and Community RC (N=28)

One female participant describes the complexity of her living situation and an arranged marriage in the following way:

⇒ I moved in with my older sister (she lives at another lady's house). I am in an arrangement to be married to the younger brother of the lady who allowed me to live with her but this is a bad situation and I want to get out. I am 6 months pregnant already and I have just left my arranged husband to be because he is often physically violent toward me. -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2013

While there are few married participants in the Female SP/RC group, like the older Female RC group, this group faces challenges in developing supportive and encouraging marriages (Figure 4). Of the five participants currently married or with partners, most (4) are described as newly

formed over their last year interviewed. These participants are just getting to know their partners or spouses. The only female participant to be in a relationship for three years reflects on the difficulties she experienced in her marriage every year:

- ⇒ I have had many arguments with my mother. So, I have decided to marry a man who lives not so far from my mother's house. After I got married I moved to live with him and my parents-in-law. They let us live in a small shack behind their house. It does not have a roof or stairs or 4 walls. -Female Survivor, Age 18, 2012
- ⇒ I have lots of arguments with my husband. He gets very drunk and is emotionally and physically violent towards me. I am very sad to born into a poor family. My life is so miserable. -Female Survivor, Age 19, 2013
- ⇒ I have never experienced happiness since I married my husband. He never takes care of me. He never gives me any money to support our family. I have to find food to eat by picking vegetables from around the house.... I want to separate from my husband and take my child with me but my husband and family in law have said I can go but I must leave our child with them. -Female Survivor, Age 20, 2014

While it is concerning that the majority of marriages are struggling and negative, there are several participants that express strong and healthy marriages. Within the Female RC group, four describe supportive husbands and family in laws for two or more consecutive years. In their own words:

- ⇒ He encourages me; he also supports my family and makes me happy.... I am content because my family is united. – Female Survivor, Age 30, 2013
- ⇒ Even though he (husband) is young, he is polite, humble, and loves me and he tries to earn money to support the family. -Female Survivor, Age 19, 2012
- ⇒ I feel I can trust my aunty in law the most because she has a good heart. She treats me like her children. -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2013

Participants in the Female SP/RC group also describe starting marriages with thoughtful judgment and promising relationships with the family in law.

- ⇒ I decided to marry my husband because he and his family love me... I believed he is a good man. He often came and helped me in my sewing store, at the time I opened my store... -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2014
- ⇒ I got married. We only had a small ceremony (spiritual only) for our wedding. I now live with my family in law. They are very kind to me and do not look down on me. My husband respects me. -Female Survivor, Age 17, 2013

Participants identify positive and negative relationships with many different family members (Table 9). Figures 5 and 6 depict positive and negative family relationships identified by female and male survivors over the four years of this assessment. Generally, participants that identify positive relationships with their family members in shelter programs also identify positive relationships after (re-) integration. Only disagreements regarding the choices of arranged partners or boyfriends appear to change participants' feelings regarding their relationships (positive to negative) with family members.

Literature suggests that encouraging and supportive relationships have perhaps the greatest potential to positively influence resilience among survivors (Nowak-Carter 2012; Noltemeyer and Bush 2013). Since marriage is an important societal milestone, many of the participants who are single are likely to married or enter into marriage type partnerships in the future. There are many single participants in this study, perhaps as many as 90 individuals out of 109 included in this assessment. The degree to which these survivors can foster supportive and encouraging relationships with spouses will likely determine for many whether this milestone becomes a major positive or negative turning point in their lives going forward.

Male and Female participants in the SP/RC groups express both positive and negative relationships with their mothers more often than any other family member (Table 8). Studies show that parental practices, specifically responsiveness and supportive behaviors play an important role in a child's ability to develop secure attachment relationships, an important protective factor for a child's resilience throughout their lives (Noltemeyer and Bush 2013). In general, children that learn to develop secure attachment relationships have the ability, as young adults, to foster trusting and lasting relationships, high self-esteem, the ability to express and share feelings with partners, and the ability to seek out supportive friendships when needed. Stated another way, these parental relationships, positive or negative, are likely to impact decision making and relationship building for participants as they grow into young adults. Survivors' stories, both positive and negative, reinforce this conclusion:

- ⇒ Although my family is poor, we are living together without arguments. -Female Survivor, Age 19, 2013
- $\Rightarrow$  I feel comfort when I live with my family. -Female Survivor, Age 17, 2013
- ⇒ Every time I have a problem my mother always comforts me. I trust my parents the most. -Female Survivor, Age 16, 2013
- ⇒ I am not so happy to live with my family because my mother does not allow me to go for a walk outside. When I have problem, I do not know who I can turn to /talk to. If I tell my mother, she will insult me very much. -Male Survivor, Age 13, 2013
- ⇒ My mother hits and curses me and my younger sister a lot...I don't have anyone that I can trust even my mother because she always curses me every day and she doesn't allow me to go to school anymore. -Female Survivor, Age 15, 2013





# 4.3 Discrimination

Throughout the four years included in this assessment, participants describe a range of people involved in discriminating against them because of their past experiences, from husbands, longterm partners, and family members to peers and people in the wider society, such as teachers and neighbors. Participants in school specifically report being discriminated against by teachers and classmates 'blaming and shaming' them when (if) they found out participants came from shelter programs. One female student describes her experience in school this way:

⇒ Friends at school made me feel unhappy because they mocked me and say bad words about me. I felt they were discriminating against me because they know that I used to live in a shelter. They say that shelter children were sexually exploited and raped until they got pregnant without a husband. -Female Survivor, Age 13, 2012 Neighbors, fellow students, and family in laws also discriminate and stigmatize some participants for being poor or coming from poor families. Participants describe experiences of feeling excluded, gossiped about, blamed, made to feel ashamed, criticized, ridiculed and generally looked down upon. A survivor shares her experience with discrimination by coworkers in the community in this way:

⇒ They begin to stop talking to me when they know my past. They misjudge me and no longer consider me a good person. They share my story with a new person who just came to work with us. –Female Survivor, Age 27, 2012

Discrimination, particularly following (re-) integration is a serious concern for almost half of the female survivors at least once during the assessment (Table 11). The majority of participants in the Female RC group (53%) describe being discriminated against and eleven of these participants report difficulties in the community for two or more years. In the Female SP/RC group 40% of the participants report discrimination following (re-) integration. In contrast, few individuals report being discriminated against while in shelter programs. Two situations of particular relevance include discrimination and stereotyping of "shelter girls" from classmates while at school (this occurred with participants in shelter programs and following (re-) integration) and discrimination by shelter peers because a survivor's parent(s) or family member is in jail for trafficking.

		Shelter					
		Discrimination From					
		Fam	nily	Shelter /	Program	Community	
	Total		Total		Total		Total
Assessment	Number of	Number of	Comment	Number of	Comment	Number of	Comment
Groups	Individuals	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts
Female SP	32	1	1	4	8	4	7
Female SP/RC	34	0	0	2	2	2	3
Male SP/RC	15	0	0	0	0	0	0
		Community					
				Comm	unity		
				Comm			
		Fam	nily		ion From	Comm	unity
	Total	Fam	ily Total	Discriminat	ion From	Comm	unity Total
Assessment	Total Number of		-	Discriminat	ion From Program	Comm Number of	
Assessment Groups			Total	Discriminat Shelter /	ion From Program Total		Total
	Number of	Number of	Total Comment	Discriminat Shelter /	ion From Program Total Comment	Number of	Total Comment
Groups	Number of Individuals	Number of Individuals	Total Comment Counts	Discriminat Shelter / I Number of Individuals	ion From Program Total Comment Counts	Number of Individuals	Total Comment Counts

Table 11: Survivor Experiences of Discrimination from Family, Shelters and Programs, and the Community, 2011-2014

Notes: SP-Shelter Program

RC - Re-integrated into Community

SP/RC - Shelter Program then Re-integrated into Community

Interestingly male survivors did not express being discriminated against by family or the community (Table 11). The majority of male participants describe positive experiences with neighbors and co-workers in the community after (re-) integration (Figure 7). Some describe conflicts with supervisors and fights with neighbors as well, but they are not attributed to stigma or discrimination. These results do suggest that males either tend to think about and handle discrimination differently and /or survivors past experiences are viewed differently by society based simply on gender and the cultural perceptions of men and women in Cambodia.



Female survivors express positive and negative experiences in the community with neighbors, friends, and co-workers (Figure 8). Following (re-) integration some survivors speak about the time it took for them to develop friends and supportive relationships in the community. Others

describe kind landlords and support from the head of their commune. At the same time, a considerable number of participants indicate that they kept their past a secret from co-workers, neighbors, and even from husbands and family members (particularly in the Female RC group). Participants in the Female RC often talk about conflict and discrimination in their community from neighbors and co-workers over multiple years. Moving locations and changing jobs did not always make the situation positive with some participants seemly caught in cycles of conflict with their neighbors and co-workers wherever they went. Female SP/RC participants discuss conflicts at school, family conflicts with neighbors, and to a lesser extent conflicts with co-workers. A slight majority of Female SP/RC participants (18 of 34 individuals), however, identified positive experiences in the community during at least one year.

Numerous studies report on the importance of an accepting community environment for survivors (re-) integrating into society (Crawford and Kaufman 2008; Yntiso et al. 2009; Surtees 2012; Muco 2013). While many participants in this study describe being discriminated against, others did not. The degree to which neighbors and family members did or didn't know a participant's past history and the corresponding levels of support and acceptance a participant received is, for the most part, beyond the scope of this assessment. What is evident, however, is the authentic and sincere fulfillment survivors felt when they are truly known without secrets and accepted for who they are by friends, spouses, or family. One survivor describes this experience saying:

⇒ I decided to get married to my second husband in 2012. My husband actually pursued me all along. He never got married to another woman, he wanted to marry me, so I agreed to take him. In fact, we've known each other since we were very young because we lived in the same village. Although my husband knows about my past story, he still loves me and has compassion for me. -Female Survivor, Age 29, 2012



## 4.4 Push Pull Factors<sup>7</sup>

Survivors express a number of common themes acting as push and pull factors in their lives. Push and pull factors are often used to describe the factors and dynamics involved in decisions by people to migrate as well as understanding the potential risk factors involved in unsafe migration and trafficking. In this assessment push and pull factors are assessed as they related to decisions making and life experiences told by study participants. Survivors describe starting and leaving various jobs, moving within Cambodia and migrating to other countries for perceived better employment opportunities, and forming and re-forming family units all based on various push and pull factors at work in their lives. Further, participants often talk about multiple decisions and movements during a given year.

The assessment of push and pull factors identify thirteen themes commonly discussed by participants (Table 12). These push and pull factors encompass financial, relational, social, and personal themes. Data for assessment groups are combined to evaluate factors expressed by survivors in shelter programs and (re-) integrated in the community. There are differences between participants in shelter programs and those already (re-) integrated. Fewer individuals in the shelter programs discuss these themes, without exception. These results are expected, given the primary objective of shelter programs to provide secure and supportive environments for survivors.

	1	Shelter	Commu	nity Combined
	Number of Total Comment		Number of	Total Comment
Push / Pull Themes	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts
debt	28	38	48	93
insufficient earnings	16	18	46	91
family pressure/obligation	21	29	45	87
conflict	19	30	42	82
feeling unhappy	18	30	38	68
relationship/marriage	10	15	37	78
health	12	19	31	41
family problems	18	32	30	59
unemployment	2	2	24	34
family health	4	4	23	30
pregnancy	4	4	18	23
perceived better				
employment opportunity	0	0	16	24
community stigma	4	9	13	21

Table 12: Push Pull Factors Expressed by Survivors, 2011-2014

Notes: All groups combined to Shelter (N=79) and Community (N=72)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> In this paper we define 'Push' factors as those themes and events participants describe either within and outside their control which move them away (push) from certain relationships, places of residence or work situations. Like wise we define 'Pull' factors as those themes and events participants describe, either within and outside their control, which draw them toward (pull) certain relationships, places of residence or work situations. Like wise we define 'Pull' factors as those themes and events participants describe, either within and outside their control, which draw them toward (pull) certain relationships, places of residence or work situations. We also describe some of these factors in the literature review under 2.2 Survivor Vulnerabilities and Risk Factors During Re-integration. Having described our use of 'push pull' we recognize the expression has varying definitions related to trafficking and unsafe migration risks (see Miles et. al. 2011, page 29, of Rushings cited in Derks et. al. 2006).

Generally the relative important of these themes is similar between groups whether participants are in shelter programs or (re-) integrated in the community (Table 12). Participants talk most often about debt, insufficient earnings, and obligations to financially support family members. These three themes are followed in relative importance by relational conflicts, feeling unhappy, and family problems for participants in shelters programs and relationships/marriage for participants (re-) integrated in the community. Participants in shelter programs rarely mention four themes (unemployment, family health, pregnancy, and community stigma) and did not mention the theme, perceived better employment opportunity.

Studies document the financial difficulties survivors and their families endure in Southeast Asia (Surtees 2012 and 2013). The pursuit of improved economic opportunities is both an important push factor and constant concern for survivors and their families. Figures 9 and 10 depict the theme surrounding "earnings in the family unit" over the course of this assessment for (re-) integrated participants. The results suggest most families of male participants struggle to earn enough money to survive. Several families and one survivor have migrated to Thailand looking for work. Many male survivors worry about money and others speak about the feelings of loneliness and abandonment in having their mothers leave them to go and find work in Thailand. In his own words:

⇒ If you don't bring me to Thailand with you, I will not eat and stop going to school. I will just ride my bike around and try and get into trouble. I want to live with my mother. - Male Survivor, Age 14, 2014

Likewise most female participants are struggling to earn enough money for their families (Figure 10). However, unlike the male participants, there are several survivors that speak about improving financial situations. Most survivors that have sufficient earnings in their family do so because more than one member of the family is contributing money. As expected, many participants that indicate they are earning enough money to meet their family needs are employed by NGOs. Cleaning services in the hospitality industry and supervisors in the garment industry are two positions in private industry where survivors are working successfully and earning a sufficient income for their families. One participant describes her work in the garment industry in her own voice:

- ⇒ I have been working in a garment factory for 6 months. My salary is \$130 per month and I think my salary is enough for my daily spending. -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2013
- $\Rightarrow$  At my workplace they promoted me to be a team leader. My salary has increased. -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2014



The assessment of push pull factors demonstrates that decision making among survivors is far more complex than any one factor. Over the four years evaluated, (re-) integrated participants identify every one of these factors, at one time or another, as the important decision making factor. This is to say that many times these factors converge together as survivors describe their decisions and the resulting life changes, whether it is leaving job training, leaving a good job, relocating, moving in with family members, or moving out with other family member. Often changes in personal relationships (getting married or leaving a marriage) and pregnancy meant survivors needed to rebalance their lives and many moved to new locations to do so. In another example, insufficient earning may not be an important push factor in a survivor's life until a family member is sick, loses his/her job and needs money for medical care. Now these financial strains cause a family to re-balance (if they can) and even leave good jobs in search of perceived better employment opportunities to pay off debts.



The longitudinal assessment illustrates the complexity of push and pull factors at work in the lives of survivors. In her own words, one survivor describes these factors at work in her life from 2013 to 2014:

Female Survivor, Age 28,29	Push and Pull Factors - 2013
⇒ <b>(2013)</b> - I changed my job to work as house helper. I now get \$140 per month. But	Perceived better employment opportunity
working here is not like the place I use to work. At my old place, I had good relationship with my friends who worked with me. However, working here, my co- workers are rude and make me feel unhappy.	Job related conflicts Feeling unhappy
⇒ They begin to stop talking to me when they know my past. They misjudge me and no longer consider me a good person. They share my story with a new person who just came to work with us.	Community stigma
⇒ My mother is very old now and no one looks after her. I have to send money home every month and sometime I have to help my nephew who is working in Thailand as well. I feel sad.	Family obligation Feeling unhappy
⇒ My family is in debt and I have to send money home to pay all the debt including the interest because my parents are old and cannot work.	Debt Family obligation
$\Rightarrow$ My health is not good. I often get sick as well. My parents are sick.	Personal health Family health
⇒ <b>(2014)</b> - I have had some difficulty dealing with my boss.	<u>Push and Pull Factors – 2014</u> Job related conflicts
<ul> <li>⇒ I stopped working now because I have an argument with my boss and my health was not good as well. I have come to stay with my parents in the province while I am sick.</li> <li>I have spent all of my money on my medical treatment. Now I want to look for another job.</li> </ul>	Personal health Unemployment Insufficient earnings

The average number of push and pull factors over all individual assessment years are determined for the assessment groups and various categories of personal well-being and family relationships (Table 13). The results provide insight regarding expressions of push pull factors among participants. The Female RC group consistently express the highest average number of push and pull factors across all categories. This group is the oldest among all groups. Participants have lived in the community the longest and spent no appreciable time in shelter programs. When participants are either worried about life or in a negative family relationships they tend to express more push and pull factors as they describe their life experiences. Not surprisingly participants that feel satisfied and happy or are in a positive family relationship express fewer push and pull factors as they describe life. It is possible that many of the same push and pull factors are present but are not processed and/or expressed by individuals in the groups either feeling satisfied and happy or in a positive family relationship. These results are consistent across assessment groups in shelter programs and (re-) integrated in the community.

	Shelter					
	Average Number of Push / Pull Factors					
		Feeling	Positive	Worried	Negative	
Assessment	Overall	Satisfied	Family	About	Family	
Groups	Average	Happy	Relationship	Life	Relationship	
Female SP	2.6	0.7	0.7	3.3	3.6	
Female SP/RC	2.3	0.9	1.0	2.3	3.8	
Male SP/RC	2.1	1.3	1.4	1.7		
	Community					
			Community	y		
		Average N	Communit umber of Pusi		ctors	
		Average N Feeling	umber of Pusi		ctors Negative	
Assessment	Overall		umber of Pusi	n / Pull Fa		
Assessment Groups		Feeling	umber of Pusi Positive	Vorried	Negative	
	Overall	Feeling Satisfied	umber of Push Positive Family	Vorried About	Negative Family	
Groups	Overall Average	Feeling Satisfied Happy	umber of Pusł Positive Family Relationship	Vorried About Life	Negative Family Relationship	

Table 13: Average Push / Pull Factors for Select Themes, 2011-2014

Notes: SP-Shelter Program

RC - Re-integrated into Community

SP/RC - Shelter Program then Re-integrated into Community

-- - Group did not express a negative family relationship

No participant describes feeling satisfied and happy when there is no positive family relationship present in his or her life (Table 14). This holds true for all participants (re-) integrated in the community over all the years evaluated. Results for survivors expressing happiness and satisfaction in the community are analyzed with three select themes, insufficient earnings, negative family relationship only (with no positive family relationship identified), and discrimination (Table 14). These themes are examined based on their importance for survivors during (re-) integration as identified in literature and the longitudinal assessment. The analysis

includes 77 individuals comprising the three assessment groups and a total of 165 individual assessment years (see Table 4). The results suggest that these three themes play an important role in determining feelings of satisfaction and happiness among survivors in the community. Perhaps the most telling result is the impact of a negative family relationship on the resilience and expressions of well-being by survivors.

	Total Com	ment Counts in the Co	ommunity
Assessment	Insufficient Earnings and Feeling	Negative Family Relationship <sup>1</sup> and Feeling	Discrimination and Feeling
Groups	Satisfied and Happy	Satisfied and Happy	Satisfied and Happy
Female RC	1	0	2
Female SP/RC	0	0	2
Male SP/RC	1	0	

Table 14: Re-integrated Survivor Expressions of Satisfaction and Happiness Along with Select Themes, 2011-2014

Notes: RC - Re-integrated into Community

SP/RC - Shelter Program then Re-integrated into Community

- Negative Family Relationship only was identified if survivors did not express other close positive family relationships
- -- Group did not express feeling discriminated in the community

# 4.5 Survivor Expressions of Resilience

Survivor expressions of resilience in many ways demonstrate their ability to adapt in challenging life circumstances. Survivors did this by expressing feelings of well-being and at other times demonstrating perseverance during challenging times and in the face of adversity. Ten themes surrounding resilience are identified based on the expressions and responses of participants. They include:

- 1) Descriptions of positive life changes in shelter programs and through other NGO programs
- 2) Descriptions of positive life changes in the community
- 3) Expressions of personal inner awareness, what I think and what I feel about an important life situation or experience
- 4) Descriptions of close personal relationships
- 5) **Descriptions of struggle and working hard**
- 6) Expressions of resolve or the act of remaining steadied in a difficult life situation
- 7) Showing judgment in making difficult life decisions
- 8) Decision making away from high risk behaviors and life situations
- 9) Maintained balance between work and other important life obligations
- 10) Identified support structures in the community outside NGOs

These ten themes are generally similar to seven themes identified by Gray (2012, Table 15). Survivor expressions of resilience are identified for participants in shelter programs and (re-) integrated in the community. Many individuals describe positive life changes or hope for the future while living in the shelter programs. Participants in shelter programs also convey introspective thoughts and show resolve during conflicts. Again, shelter life is designed to protect, support, and balance the lives of survivors, leading to fewer expressions of these themes overall. Once survivors are back in the community they tend to express these resilience themes with greater frequency. When combined, hope for the future is the highest category for participants living in the community followed by introspection. Maintaining balance in life and identifying support structures in the community are the lowest categories identified for participants during the assessment.

		Shelter		<b>Community Combined</b>	
			Total		Total
	Themes Identified	Number of	Comment	Number of	Comment
Resilience Themes	by Gray (2012)	Individuals	Counts	Individuals	Counts
described positive life changes					
in shelter or through program	hope for the future	24	31	11	14
described positive life changes					
in community	hope for the future	1	1	18	22
shows personal inner					
awareness	introspection	7	7	26	31
descibes close					
friendship/relationship	interconnectedness	2	2	18	31
describes working hard	perserverance	2	2	19	21
shows resolve during conflict	perserverance	5	6	12	21
shows judgement in making a					
difficult life decision	self perservation	1	1	10	17
decision making away from					
high risk	steadied	1	1	12	12
found balances for work and					
other obligations	adaptability	1	3	8	8
identified support structures					
in the community	adaptability	1	1	7	7

Notes: All groups combined to Shelter (N=79) and Community (N=72)

Each of these themes is broken down further in order to better understand survivor expressions. The breakdown focuses on expressions of resilience by participants already (re-) integrated in the community. In some cases resilience themes are broken down into various subjects (e.g. hope of the future), while others are reviewed by looking directly at representative quotes from survivors (e.g. introspection).

## Hope for the Future

Participants living in the community most often express hope for the future regarding their employment and the prospect of earning a salary sufficient to support their family unit (Table 16).

	Total Comment
Hope for the Future	Counts
employment with sufficient earning	12
accepts job training after (re-)	
integration	6
close relationship that provides	
financial security	6
marriage	5
shows promise in school	5
relationship building in family or	
community	5
learning to achieve life balance	5
faith	4
job promotion	3
home being built	2

Table 16: Hope for the Future Expressed by Survivors in the Community

Another group includes those offered job training after previously quitting or refusing these opportunities (Table 16). Others express hope for the future because of their marriage, supportive friendships, and even an improvement in relations with in law family members. Four participants attribute hope for the future to their faith in Jesus Christ and the transformative work of God in their lives. Others discuss job promotions and learning to maintain a balance in life. While these expressions of resilience are important in the lives of survivors at the time they are recorded, not all the situations described have successful outcomes over time (e.g. marriages). Quotes from survivors discuss hope of the future.

### Hope for the Future:

- ⇒ Because (in the community) everyone talks with me and I talk with them. -Female Survivor, Age 17, 2013
- ⇒ I like my job now and my salary is enough for my daily expenses. -Female Survivor, Age 23, 2014
- ⇒ I like living with my foster family because I can concentrate more on my studies. -Female Survivor, Age 19, 2012
- ⇒ I have been training in sewing/tailor skills. I have learned a lot about sewing. I have been going to Church every Sunday and I have learned about the Word of God. -Female Survivor, Age 19, 2011
- ⇒ I think that my family situation will not improve any by working there. So, I want to have my own skill...I opened a salon shop at my house. -Female Survivor, Age 35, 2014
- ⇒ Recently my workplace moved me to work in another place again, in room service. I can earn \$160 per month. -Female Survivor, Age 31, 2014
- ⇒ When I believe in God, God heals my thinking a lot. When I didn't believe him in the past, I wanted to die because I felt life was difficult. -Female Survivor, Age 27, 2012
- ⇒ I can earn an income every day and even though I do not earn much it is enough for my daily household's expenses. -Female Survivor, Age 30, 2013
- ⇒ Working here, I got to know Jesus Christ and I believe in Him. I have changed a lot my behavior, the way I speak, and how I see my past experiences as lessons in my life. -Female Survivor, Age 37, 2012
- ⇒ I felt a little better because my husband and his family treated me nicer than before.
   When I visited them, they welcomed me unlike what they did before. -Female
   Survivor, Age 31, 2013
- $\Rightarrow$  Because this year I have saved a lot and plan to build a house. -Female Survivor, Age 22 2011

#### Introspection

Participants express a wide variety of introspective feelings and thoughts. Many reflect on positive life changes over the course of a participant's life in shelter programs or work assistance programs. Some quotes reflect internal processing of challenging life circumstances involving discrimination and difficulties in personal relationships. Other quotes reflect personal goals and

personal well-being felt as a result of achievements in jobs and salary. The following quotes from survivors document these introspective thoughts and feelings.

## Introspection from Survivors in Community – What I Think:

- ⇒ I plan to finish my studies through college so that I will have a future and a good job so that no one will look down/underestimated me. -Female Survivor, Age 18, 2014
- ⇒ I think I have grown a lot and I feel more responsible. I like to study in the Church because I can listen to the Word of God and I wanted to be a missionary someday in the future. -Male Survivor, Age 16, 2012
- $\Rightarrow$  My goal is to finish my school studies and then go to college and have good job with a high salary. -Male Survivor, Age 14, 2013
- ⇒ I am changing myself a lot. I am strong and I don't cry easily like before. I try to make myself strong so that people won't look down me. -Female Survivor, Age 16, 2013
- $\Rightarrow$  I still struggle and have difficulties like before but I want to solve problem on my own. -Female Survivor, Age 29, 2012
- $\Rightarrow$  I have changed myself so I think that I am good now. -Female Survivor, Age 23, 2012
- ⇒ I have responsibilities to look after my younger sister because no one will look after her. I do not have any relatives that I can depend on.... Now I feel that I have become an adult and think a lot more compared to before. -Female Survivor, Age 24, 2014
- ⇒ I feel that I have become a strong person now. I think deeply before I do things and being independent, I can take care of myself. -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2012

- ⇒ I felt independent because I now having a job and could earn money to support myself. -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2012
- $\Rightarrow$  I felt really angry with them and sometimes unable to control my feeling as well. -Female Survivor, Age 15, 2012
- ⇒ After I aborted my baby, my boyfriend no longer connected with me. He stopped phoning me and visiting and meeting me. My boyfriend did not pay anything for my abortion fee; I paid by myself alone... Because of that I felt very depressed and discouraged. -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2012
- ⇒ I feel a little frustrated as to whether I should return home as my mother wishes and get married to the man she has arranged, or continue to work... -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2014
- ⇒ I am very happy with our food business. I can earn a lot of money. But at the same time I also feel sad because I do not use my salon skills. I will open a salon shop in the future when I save enough money. -Female Survivor, Age 24, 2014
- ⇒ Before I felt valueless and always upset but now, after I got a job here, I felt I have value. -Female Survivor, Age 27, 2012
- $\Rightarrow$  I can control my feelings much better. -Female Survivor, Age 32, 2013
- ⇒ I used to cry a lot in the past before I stayed in the shelter. I felt a lot of pain about my past experience every time my counselor asked me. When they asked about my experiences, I always cried. I did not want to remember my past. However, every time I shared it, I felt released. -Female Survivor, Age 25, 2013
- ⇒ Because now I'm an educated person, so I try to cut down feeling angry like before...I feel much better because I know how to relax. I'm not thinking about other problems.
   -Female Survivor. Age 31, 2013

#### Interconnectedness

Participants describe close personal relationships with friends, husbands, and family members. Survivors talk about their personal well-being in positive close relationships, feeling supported, protected, valued, united, trusted, and taken seriously (listened to). Examples of survivor expressions of interconnectedness are provided below, additional quotes can be found in the previous discussion on relationships (Section 4.2).

Interco	nnectedness from Survivors in Community:
	I love my parents very much. I am the 1st siblings. Therefore, I understand about my family's needFemale Survivor, Age 17, 2013
	Junny Sheed. Temale Salvivol, Age 17, 2015
$\Rightarrow$	I felt I could trust my older sister and my father the most because they understood me and gave me more freedomFemale Survivor, Age 15, 2012
⇒	My husband loves me so much even though he knew that I already had one son Female Survivor, Age 24, 2013
$\Rightarrow$	Now I have a new boyfriend. He understands and listens to me. He always encourages and cares about meFemale Survivor, Age 23, 2013
⇒	I stopped living with my close girlfriend, because she has moved to the province to help look after her aunt's children. We just keep in contact through the phone There is a guy who loves me and we plan to get married very soon. I feel really happy. -Female Survivor, Age 26, 2014
⇒	I am happy because I have my female close friend who always protect and helps me every time costumers do bad things to meFemale Survivor, Age 23, 2013
$\Rightarrow$	l trust my female close friend very much. Every time we go to anywhere we go togetherFemale Survivor, Age 26, 2012
$\Rightarrow$	My husband trusts me when we have discussionsFemale Survivor, Age 21, 2013
$\Rightarrow$	My family is united. We help each other. And my job is better than beforeFemale Survivor, Age 30, 2013
$\Rightarrow$	My husband is so good. He always listens to me and we have favor for each other Female Survivor, Age 25, 2013

### Perseverance

Expressions of perseverance include the resolve needed to remain steadied through a difficult life situation. Survivors often describe long-term life challenges, particularly around marriages. Personal relationships and family relationships account for the majority of circumstances surrounding survivors that express perseverance and resolve during prolonged conflict (Table 17 below). Quotes include participants that display steadied lives year-to-year, in the face of difficulties. Often these participants have support in their community or a positive family relationship from which they draw encouragement.

Table 17: Perseverance Expressed by Survivors in the Community

	Total Comment
Perseverance - Resolve During Conflict	Counts
personal relationships	11
family relationships	9
discrimiation - work	3
discrimiation - neighborhood	2
pregnancy	2

#### Perseverance - Resolve During Conflict:

- ⇒ My step mother always blames me when I make mistakes. I feel like my step mother doesn't love me as her biological children. -Female Survivor, Age 15, 2012
- ⇒ I had an argument with my husband. We fought with each other. My husband didn't listen to me when I told him not to go out and drink a lot of alcohol. -Female Survivor, Age 25, 2014
- ⇒ The environment at my work place is not very good because there is a man who often waves/jokes at me. Sometimes he touches my cheeks and tries to kiss or hug me as well. -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2012
- ⇒ I am not so happy to live with my family because my mother does not allow me to go for a walk outside. When I have problem, I do not know who I can turn to /talk to. If I tell my mother, she will insult me very much. -Male Survivor, Age 13, 2013

A common theme in resilience among study participants is the ability to work hard and even reflect a sense of struggle in hard work to accomplish a goal or fulfill a family obligation. Other studies of resilience in Cambodia identify hard work as an important part of resilience for survivors of the Khmer Rouge (Overland 2012). In some ways a willingness to work hard demonstrates a motivation needed to succeed, an important trait for survivors (re-) integrating into the community (Muco 2013). While in shelter programs, several participants indicated that their parents or shelter staff encouraged them to work hard and study. Many survivors describe their ability to work hard in a variety of situations including becoming the primary care giver after the death of a mother, working and struggling as a migrant laborer in another country (e.g. Thailand), working to fulfill family obligations, studying hard, and working hard to start a business. Even if other life situations are negative, often participants derived a sense of satisfaction based on their hard work and contribution to the family unit.

#### Perseverance - Hard Work and Struggle from Survivors in Community:

- ⇒ My mother recently died. I feel no one will look after my younger sibling. The time I lived in the shelter... I did nothing besides going to study but at home I need to do everything and I worry very much. -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2013
- ⇒ My mother felt pity on me because I work very hard to support the family -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2012
- ⇒ Now I work in Thailand with my husband to pick fruit and vegetables. I live with my husband and my children in the same rental room and my mother and her husband live in another room near us. My husband and I often have arguments with each other because he always asks to go back to Cambodia. -Female Survivor, Age 25, 2014
- ⇒ I have to work very hard picking coconuts because I am afraid that the money lender will come to take their money back and we don't have money for them. -Male Survivor, Age 16, 2013
- ⇒ I feel tired because I work as garment worker and also help my mother's small business. -Female Survivor, Age 15, 2013
- ⇒ I must work to earn money and try to pay off our debt. Life is difficult. -Female Survivor, Age 22, 2013
- $\Rightarrow$  I try to study hard and I have received a good score at school. I want to be an engineer in the future. -Male Survivor, Age 13, 2013
- ⇒ My family is in debt (\$250) for improving my house. I have to work harder so that I can help my family repay the debt. -Female Survivor, Age 23, 2013
- ⇒ My workplace moved me to work in another position but in the same program. I learn a lot in my new position.... It was very hard for me to learn a new language (English) because I am a little older and its hard to remember. -Female Survivor, Age 30, 2013
- ⇒ Running my own store is not easy work because I have to wake up early in the morning and prepare the foods to sell and spend the whole day in the store and look after the children. -Female Survivor, Age 30, 2013
- $\Rightarrow$  I try to work hard by myself. -Female Survivor, Age 32, 2013
- $\Rightarrow$  I am so happy that my sewing shop is running well. I earn a lot every day. I have no time to rest because I have many systematic Formula Survival Acc 17, 2014

#### **Self Preservation and Steadied Decision Making**

The themes involving self preservation and steadied decision making overlap to some degree in the assessment. Self preservation decision making by survivors most often involves relationships and employment followed by job training and pregnancy (Table 18 below). There are instances where survivors felt they have no choice but to quit training programs or even good jobs in order to preserve their emotional well-being and support their families. Many try to weigh this decision but short-term survival needs seem to take priority (whether it is to pay back debtors, regain emotional stability, or try to find immediate sustainable income). Often these decisions are complex, such as during unwanted pregnancies, with multiple conflicts or potential conflicts arising as a result of the pregnancy. These decisions overlap when steadied decision making involved survivors moving away from high risk behavior or life circumstances. Survivor quotes expressing "steadied decision making" follow Table 18, below. This theme is also discussed in greater detail in Section 4.1 (see Table 7, page 24).

	Total Co Cou	
Self-Preservation Decision Making	Toward	Away
relationship	1	6
employment	2	4
school or job training	1	3
pregnancy -giving birth	2	1

Table 18: Self-Preservation Decision Making Expressed by Survivors in the Community

### Steadied - Decision Making Away from High Risk by Survivors in Community:

- ⇒ I am happy because I escaped from my partner and now I no longer get hit by him or anyone else like before. Female Survivor, Age 23, 2013
- ⇒ I am 6 month pregnant already. I just left my fiancé because he treated me very badly. He often beat me. -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2013
- ⇒ I told my husband, "You have made a lot of mistakes against me, I can't take you anymore; you took our money to buy drug and told me that you gave it to your mother." -Female Survivor, Age 28, 2012
- $\Rightarrow$  I had a very big fight with my husband and we decided to live separately. -Female Survivor, Age 35, 2014
- ⇒ One of my friends introduced me to a man but he has relationships with many other girls too. So, I decided not to have a relationship with him. -Female Survivor, Age 38, 2013

## Adaptability

Survivor expressions of adaptability include descriptions of finding or maintaining balance between work and other important life obligations and identifying supportive structures in the community apart from NGOs (Table 19 below and quotes from survivors on the following page). These themes are expressed the fewest number of times by participants (see Table 15).

	Total Comment
Adaptability -Support in Community	Counts
neighbors	2
village leaders	2
landlord	2
education outside school	1
	Total Comment
Adaptability - Balance Work and Life	Total Comment Counts
Adaptability - Balance Work and Life work - family/ pregnancy	
work - family/ pregnancy	

Table 19: Adaptability Expressed by Survivors in the Community

While many participants describe friendships and sharing between neighbors in the community, few describe connections with religious groups or the church community<sup>8</sup>. There are survivors that discussed being a part of a church community following (re-) integration but most describe this connection in part as their home, facilitated by an NGO follow-up program. Indeed these NGO programs are beneficial but no participant describes connecting to a church/religious community apart from their assistance. This part of the community, when present, is identified as an important connection point for survivors and a potentially important factor in building resilience among children/teenagers and young adults (Werner 1993; Hawkins et al. 2009; Nowak-Carter 2012).

Many participants are either unable or unwilling to balance work and other important life obligations. Pregnancy often causes families to go into greater debt, re-locate, and quit their jobs rather than adapt in the current situation. As such several participants who became pregnant report quitting stable supportive jobs. Only four instances are identified where survivors are able to positively adapt to this change. Likewise in order to handle the push and pull factors related to family obligations and debt, some student participants describe quitting school in search of employment to help support the family. Most participants are not able to balance school and find a job that contributed in a meaningful way to family earnings. Only two young participants talk about contributing to their families' income by selling lottery tickets while still remaining in school. No participants are able to balance working at a job to support

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> It should be noted that all but one assistance programs involved in the Butterfly Project are Christian organizations.

their family and attending training programs if these programs provided limited or no financial assistance.

## Adaptability -Support in Community:

- $\Rightarrow$  I keep my son with a neighbor when I go to work. -Female Survivor, Age 23, 2013
- ⇒ Because he (head of Commune) wants to be a friend and help me when I have problems. -Female Survivor, Age 23, 2013
- ⇒ My neighbors and landlord are kind to me. I have been living alone in a rental room since I left my fiancé. -Female Survivor, Age 21, 2013
- ⇒ I don't want my daughter to walk down my path that is why I try very hard for her. I let her take Khmer, English, and Chinese classes. -Female Survivor, Age 29, 2012
- ⇒ Most of the people in this community, especially the children, they like me. The village chief asked me to teach other kids here (english). -Female Survivor, Age 14, 2014

### Adaptability - Balance Work and Life:

- ⇒ I sold lottery tickets to people in my neighborhood. I felt happier with my income generation. I still went to study. -Female Survivor, Age 16, 2013
- ⇒ My living is still the same and I still continue my business as lottery seller. I am happy that I can earn this much money. Some of my money I gave to my mother every month (\$60 for rental fee). -Male Survivor, Age 14, 2014
- ⇒ I am living with my biological mother. Now I have stopped working in the restaurant in order to prepare for my wedding day. -Female Survivor, Age 25, 2013
- ⇒ Now I ask my mother to stay with us in the city because I want her to stay with us and she can help look after my daughter as well while I am very busy at work. -Female Survivor. Aae 31. 2014

# 5.0 Summary and Conclusions

The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project is the first longitudinal study to follow children and adult survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking, starting from the time they are in aftercare programs through (re-) integration. The longitudinal study design addresses a significant limitation identified in cross sectional studies involving survivor (re-) integration (Derks et al. 2006; Reimer et al. 2007; Surtees 2013). The project follows a select group of individuals in Cambodia and has already collected a wide array of data between 2011 and 2014. The purpose of this study is to gain a long-term understanding of what the (re-) integration process involves for survivors, what they experience during this process, and how their lives evolve over time.

# 5.1 Factors Important to Personal Well-Being

This assessment focuses on survivor experiences and their expressions of resilience through (re-) integration. Various factors and aspects of resilience are identified and discussed by listening to the collective 'voices' of survivors. It draws on the four years of longitudinal data collected in surveys and interviews with survivors throughout Cambodia. The assessment focuses on relationships, discrimination, and various life factors as they relate to well-being.

## Relationships

A substantial number of participants in the Female RC group are struggling in their relationships with spouses and their spouses' parents. Within this group, 15 of the 19 participants married or involved in long-term relationships describe a negative relationship with their boyfriend or spouse and/or his parents over their last year interviewed. Nine of these 15 participants recount negative conditions for two or more consecutive years. The majority describe living with their in laws at some point after marriage and spoke of the difficulty adjusting to their new family unit. Unfortunately many participants describe enduring years of alcohol related physical violence, emotional abuse, physical threats, infidelity, drug addiction, and abandonment by their husbands or boyfriends and the family in law. Although there are few married participants in the Female SP/RC group, like the older Female RC group, this group faces similar challenges in developing supportive and encouraging marriages.

Both community and (re-) integrated participants identify their mothers as the most important family relationship. Male and Female participants in the SP/RC groups express both positive and negative relationships with their mothers more often than any other family member. Family problems and troubled relationships are all to common and often a consistent theme year to year with both female and male participants (re-) integrating from the shelter programs. Once (re-) integrated, female participants often describe conflicts with their family stemming from disagreements over relationships with boyfriends / partners and arranged marriages. In some instances, survivors place themselves at risk of family violence because of their choices to continue personal and intimate relationships without their family's approval (either their own family or their boyfriend's family).

#### Discrimination

Discrimination following (re-) integration is a serious concern exposed by almost half of the female survivors at least once during the assessment. Throughout the four years included in this assessment, participants describe a range of people involved in discriminating against them because of their past experiences, from husbands, long-term partners, and family members to peers and people in the wider society, such as teachers and neighbors. Neighbors, fellow students, and family in laws also discriminate and stigmatize some participants for being poor or coming from poor families. Participants in school specifically report discrimination and stereotyping of "shelter girls" from classmates (this occurred with participants in shelter programs and following (re-) integration).

Female survivors express positive and negative experiences in the community with neighbors, friends, and co-workers. Following (re-) integration some survivors speak about the time it took for them to develop friends and supportive relationships in the community. Others describe kind landlords and support from the head of their commune. At the same time, a considerable number of participants indicate that they kept their past a secret from co-workers, neighbors, and even from husbands and family members. Older participants talk about conflict and discrimination in their community from neighbors and co-workers over multiple years. Moving locations and changing jobs did not always make the situation positive with some participants seemly caught in cycles of conflict with their neighbors and co-workers wherever they went.

Interestingly male survivors do not express being discriminated against by family or the community. The majority of male participants describe positive experiences with neighbors and co-workers in the community after (re-) integration. Some describe conflicts with supervisors and fights with neighbors as well, but they do not attribute these conflicts to stigma or discrimination. This assessment is limited to a small sample size (15 individuals) and further study will be needed to explore discrimination against male survivors in the community.

Numerous studies report on the importance of an accepting community environment for survivors (re-) integrating into society (Crawford and Kaufman 2008; Yntiso et al. 2009; Surtees 2012; Muco 2013). While many participants in this study describe being discriminated against, others did not. At the same time, a considerable number of participants indicate that they keep the past a secret from co-workers, neighbors, and even from husbands and family members (particularly in the Female RC group). The degree to which neighbors and family members do or don't know a participant's past history and the corresponding levels of support and acceptance a participant received is beyond the scope of this assessment.

### **Employment Opportunities and Family Earnings**

The pursuit of improved economic opportunities is both an important push factor and constant concern for survivors and their families. The assessment suggests most families of participants struggle to earn enough money to survive. Several families have migrated to Thailand looking for work. However, there are several survivors that speak about improving financial situations. Most survivors that have sufficient earnings in their family do so because more than one

member of the family is contributing money. Many participants that indicate they are earning enough money to meet their family needs are employed by NGOs. Cleaning services in the hospitality industry and supervisors in the garment industry are two positions in private industry where survivors are working successfully and earning a sufficient income for their families.

A detailed assessment of the issues and challenges surrounding survivor debt, employment, and training/education is not part of the scope of this thematic paper. However, this study does reveal some of these challenges that survivors face as they (re-) integrate into the community. Employment opportunities and sufficient earnings are important factors within the family and a constant worry for many survivors and their families. Debt increases stress for most participants, particularly if they are the only family members earning money to support the family unit. Many participants in this study have exited job training programs to support their family. Instead of attending school, some underage survivors looked for jobs to contribute to the family earnings in a meaningful way. Most (re-) integration programs seek to address these concerns and issues through school assistance, job placement, micro businesses, social enterprises, and other follow-up services. Given the various NGO programs and the breadth of data involved in the Butterfly Project, further assessment of these data is recommended in order to specifically address the strengths, challenges and issues surrounding survivor debt, employment, and training/education.

### **Expressions of Well-Being**

Both groups (in the shelter programs and (re-) integrated) express feeling satisfied and happy with various aspects of life. Participants express worry about life while in shelter programs and after (re-) integration in the community. Worries in the shelter include concerns over family members who are sick or hungry at home, concerns regarding (re-) integration and the difficulties they may face when there back home, concerns about studies / school, and concerns over court cases, particularly if they involve family members. Those that have already (re-) integrated tend to worry more about issues of sickness, debt, earning enough to survive, earning no money while in school/training, unemployment, and children. Many of the participants express that the life in the shelter programs is good for them, particularly the youngest group Female SP. Many note the love they receive from staff and shelter moms, as well as the stability and security the home provides (food, medical care, and a good place to live). After (re-) integration many survivors indicate that life is more difficult outside the shelter.

The assessment cross-references three select themes, insufficient earnings, negative family relationship only (with no positive family relationship identified), and community discrimination with survivors' expressions of happiness and satisfaction in the community. The analysis includes 77 individuals already (re-) integrated in the community ranging from one to four years (see Table 4). The results identify only two instances where participants express feelings of well-being along with insufficient earnings and four instances where participants identify feelings of well-being along with community discrimination. No participant describes feeling satisfied and happy when there is only a negative family relationship in his or her life. The results suggest

these three themes play an important role in determining feelings of satisfaction and happiness among survivors in the community.

# 5.2 Longitudinal Assessment of Resilience

The longitudinal assessment follows participants through several important societal milestones and transitions. Almost all the participants will reach young adulthood over the ten-year study time frame. Based on the average starting ages of the assessment groups, the majority of women in the Female SP/RC are now in this transition period to become young adults. Many have yet to reach this transition in the youngest groups, Female SP and Male SP/RC; while everyone over the last four years in the Female RC group has become young adults or adults. Maturing, making decisions regarding life directions and relationships, and learning to live independently are all topics survivors discussed during this transition.

There are transitions happening as well. Survivors are re-entering schools or joining job training programs while apart of shelter programs and leaving/graduating from schools and various NGO work and training programs to find employment in the community. The transitions from shelter programs and transition homes into the community are often complex as survivors re-adjust to families, neighbors, personal relationships (e.g. boyfriends), communities, schools, and changes in standards of living.

## **Positive and Negative Turning Points**

Werner (1993) discusses the significance of "major turning points" that occur in the lives of young adults impacting resilience. The author discusses the role of education and active participation in church or a religious community in linking high-risk children / now young-adults with positive life changing opportunities such as high paying jobs and supportive relationships. Similarly, this assessment identifies several positive and negative turning points in the lives of (re-) integrated survivors.

Literature clearly demonstrates that encouraging and supportive relationships have perhaps the greatest potential to positively influence resilience among survivors (Nowak-Carter 2012; Noltemeyer and Bush 2013). When asked, almost all female survivors in this study express the desire to be married to an honest and supportive husband and start a family. However, many of the participants in this study are single, perhaps as many as 90 out of 109 individuals. Based on the full year assessment in 2013, 50% (14 individuals) of the Female RC group are married or in long-term partnerships (see Table 5). However, among the Female SP/RC group, only 15% (5 individuals) are married or with partners and no Male SP/RC participants are married or with partners. The degree to which these survivors can foster supportive and encouraging relationships with spouses will likely determine for many whether this milestone becomes a major positive or negative turning point in their lives.

As discussed previously, survivor relationships with long term partners and spouses appear, for the most part, to be a negative turning point in survivors' lives. This conclusion is based primarily on the oldest assessment group. However, participants in this group did not stay in
shelters and many were already young adults and adults. For almost all participants in the Female RC group, (re-) integration involved enrolling in NGO assistance training and work programs (many provide health care, counseling, and social working support). It remains to be seen if participants that have spent time in shelters programs have a greater ability to develop supportive and encouraging marriages over time. Most survivors in these groups (Male and Female SP/RC) are younger and single or newly married. As the Butterfly Research Project is ongoing, more data will be needed to evaluate differences, if they exist, between these assessment groups.

The assessment identifies other positive and negative turning points in survivors' lives. In Table 16, survivors discuss hope for the future including employment with sufficient earnings to support their families. Many of these jobs are with NGOs, but two survivors discuss jobs in private businesses as well. Six survivors also discuss re-enrolling in NGO job training programs that may, over time, link them to well-paying jobs in the community. Others discuss the positive role foster parents have played in creating opportunities in education and financial stability. Survivors also discuss the difficulties that pregnancy can bring, particularly if participants are not married and they know their family would not approve. Participants who became pregnant often report quitting stable supportive jobs, relocating to live with family, greater debt, and/or additional worries about the health of their new child. These positive and negative turning points are, for the most part, a direct result of survivors' decision making.

#### **Decision Making in the Community**

Parental relationships, either positive or negative, are likely to impact decision making and relationship building for a substantial group of participants in this study as the grow into young adults. Studies show that parental practices, specifically responsiveness and supportive behaviors play an important role in a child's ability to develop secure attachment relationships, an important protective factor for a child's resilience throughout their lives (Noltemeyer and Bush 2013). In general, children that learn to develop secure attachment relationships have the ability, as young adults, to foster trusting and lasting relationships, high self-esteem, the ability to express and share feelings with partners, and the ability to seek out supportive friendships when needed.

Once survivors (re-) integrate, decision-making and the structures or parental figures that help guide these processes shift from shelters back to families and/or the individuals themselves. Some of the younger participants already (re-) integrated (Male and Female SP/RC) describe parental figures participating in this process by allowing them more or less personal freedoms. Generally among the SP/RC groups, more male participants struggle to make good decisions regarding drugs/alcohol while more female participants struggle with choices in relationships and domestic violence. Participants in the Female RC group describe making high-risk decisions regarding relationships with men (e.g. marrying a man they inadvertently called on the phone while drunk), to cope with difficult situations (e.g. alcohol use to cope with domestic violence), and to support themselves and their families (e.g. returning to sex work or migrating to find employment in Thailand).

The longitudinal assessment provides the opportunity to better understand push and pull factors at work in the lives of survivors. Study participants frequently identify thirteen push and pull factors related to decisions making for changing employment and/or residence. Participants talk most often about debt, insufficient earnings, and obligations to financially support family members. This assessment shows that decision making among survivors is complex and not just related to financial earnings. Over the four years evaluated, (re-) integrated participants identify every one of thirteen factors, at one time or another, as the important decision making factor for changing employment and/or residence. Many times these factors converge together as survivors describe their decisions and the resulting life changes.

#### **Expressions of Resilience**

Survivor expressions of resilience in many ways demonstrate their ability to adapt in challenging life circumstances. Survivors express feelings of well-being and at other times demonstrate perseverance during challenges and adversity. Ten themes surrounding resilience are identified based on the expressions and responses of participants. These themes are generally similar to seven themes reported by Gray (2012). Survivor expressions of adaptability are identified the fewest number of times by participants in the assessment.

Many participants find it difficult to adapt and balance work and other important life obligations. Some participants who became pregnant report quitting stable supportive jobs indicating they could not identify a way to care for their baby and continue working. In order to handle financial stress, family obligations, and debt, some student participants describe quitting school in search of employment to help support the family. Most young participants are not able to balance school and find a job that contributed in a meaningful way to family earnings. Only two young participants talk about attending school and contributing to their families' income by selling lottery tickets. No participants found a way to work and attend training programs if these programs provide limited or no financial assistance.

No participant describes connecting to a church/religious community apart from NGO assistance. This part of the community, when present, is an important connection point for survivors and a potentially important factor in building resilience among children/teenagers and young adults (Werner 1993; Hawkins et al. 2009; Nowak-Carter 2012; Murco 2013). There are survivors that discuss being a part of church communities following (re-) integration but most describe this connection as their home as well, facilitated by an NGO follow-up program. Unfortunately this trend is not likely to change as increasing numbers of survivors complete the (re-) integration process and lose perhaps the most significant connection they had to support structures outside their local community (i.e. the NGO follow-up staff).

#### 5.3 Study Limitations

There are several strengths and limitations in this assessment. The most prominent strength over the past four years is the increasing levels of 'trust' participants express towards the research team. Whilst this evolving trust and increasing 'truth' is welcomed and appreciated as a data asset, it is also challenging when participants' later contradict their earlier accounts. In

addition, assessment groups have unequal sample sizes and numbers of visits during a given year because not all participants were accessible every year (see Table 3). Further, participants sometimes provide inconsistent responses due to emotional states on different interview days, sexual trauma and its negative affect on memory, second guessing 'answers', and wanting to 'please' the interviewer.

This assessment includes a total of 994 surveys collected over four years throughout Cambodia. Data are first collected in Khmer and later translated into English. All records are cross-checked to ensure translation accuracy. Surveys and preliminary findings are reviewed as a team to avoid cultural bias in translation and ensure that cultural perspectives are retained in data evaluations.

#### 5.4 Implications for Future Research

The Butterfly project is the first longitudinal (re-) integration research in the world seeking to follow a cohort of sexually exploited/trafficked children and adults over a ten-year period. Internationally there has been research on (re-) integration of survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking, yet to date there is a paucity of published research specific to the (re-) integration of survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking in Cambodia. Researchers examining (re-) integration of survivors of human trafficking and sexual exploitation identified the need for longitudinal studies on (re-) integration as necessary to gain a longer-term understanding of what the (re-) integration process involves, what the survivors experience and how their lives evolve over time (Derks et al. 2006; Reimer et al. 2007; Surtees 2013).

The Butterfly project is the result of a collaborative response by predominantly Chab Dai antitrafficking agencies in Cambodia who have been working with victim/survivors of sexual exploitation for nearly two decades (Delaney and Scarff 2010; Derks et al. 2006). Over the years, these agencies and assistance programs have expressed their desire to learn about the strengths and weaknesses of their programs, particularly in terms of their clients' long-term (re-) integration experiences. The purpose of this thematic paper is to provide a broad understanding of resilience using the collective 'voices' of survivors of sexual exploitation and trafficking in Cambodia following (re-) integration. Throughout this study survivors have expressed resilience in many ways, demonstrating their hope for the future and at the same time their ability to persevere and adapt in often difficult life circumstances and adversity. By disseminating these 'voices' and research findings, Chab Dai believes (re-) integration programming and policy will be informed and advanced, providing hope for the future and improving the quality of life for survivors of sexual exploitation in Southeast Asia and around the world.

The Butterfly Research Project is an ongoing ten-year study. The data collected will provide a long-term understanding of survivor (re-) integration including what they experience and how their lives change over time. Additional data will provide an opportunity to evaluate resilience over a longer time scale and revisit some of the conclusions reached in this paper.

This assessment identifies survivors across a wide-range of resilience. There are some that are thriving in spite of adversity and others that are struggling to persevere in the midst of difficult life experiences. There are still others that have developed supportive relationships and succeeded in obtaining employment that supports their family. Further research exploring quantitative measures of resilience among these groups of participants' would contribute to the overall knowledge base regarding survivor resilience and could also be coupled with the longitudinal aspects of the existing study. These types of data collection and assessment would also have practical applications among NGOs working with survivors in aftercare and (re-) integration follow-up programs.

This assessment suggests differences in the way female and male survivors experience/perceive discrimination and stigma in the community. The majority of male participants describe positive experiences with neighbors and co-workers and do not attribute conflicts in the community to stigma or discrimination. Further research exploring these situations in greater depth may provide a clearer picture of discrimination against male survivors in the community and would benefit NGO groups working with male survivors.

Employment opportunities and sufficient earnings are important factors within this study and a constant worry for many survivors and their families. Most (re-) integration programs seek to address these concerns and issues through training programs, financial assistance, job placement, small businesses and social enterprises, and other follow-up services. Further evaluation of these programs and the strengths, challenges and issues surrounding survivor financial stability would benefit NGOs and their follow-up programs.

#### 6.0 **Bibliography**

- Abu-Ali, A. and Al-Bahar, M. (2011). "Understanding Child Survivors of Human Trafficking: A Micro and Macro Level Analysis", *Procedia – Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 30, 791-796, doi:10.1016/j.sbspro.2011.10.154.
- Boyden, J. and Mann, G. (2005). "Children's Risk, Resilience, and Coping in Extreme Situations", in Handbook for Working with Children and Youth: Pathways to Resilience Across Cultures and Contexts, ed. by M. Ungar, 3-25. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.
- Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R. (2008). "Agency or Illness The Conceptualization of Trafficking: Victims' Choices and Behaviors in the Assistance System", Gender, Technology and Development, 12(1), 53-76, doi: 10.1177/097185240701200105.
- Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R. (2012a). *Leaving the Past Behind? When Victims of Trafficking Decline Assistance: Summary Report*, Fafo AIS/NEXUS Institute.
- Brunovskis, A. and Surtees, R. (2012b). "Coming Home: Challenges in Family Reintegration for Trafficked Women", Qualitative Social Work, 12(4), 454-472, doi: 10.1177/1473325011435257.
- COMMIT (2010) Region Wide Assessment of (Re-) Integration Assistance. Terms of Reference.
- Crawford, M. and Kaufman, M. R. (2008). "Sex Trafficking in Nepal: Survivor Characteristics and Long-Term Outcomes", *Violence Against Women*, 14(8), 905-916, doi: 10.1177/1077801208320906.
- Delaney, A., and Scharff, M. (2010), 'World Faiths Development Dialogue: Faith-Inspired Organizations And Development in Cambodia', World Faiths Development Dialogue (Phnom Penh: Faith-Inspired Organizations & Development in Cambodia), 176.
- Derks, A. (1998). "Reintegration of Victims of Trafficking in Cambodia", IOM/Centre for Advanced Study, 63.
- Derks, A., Henke, R., and Vanna, L. (2006), 'Review of a Decade of Research On Trafficking in Persons, Cambodia', (Phonm Penh, Cambodia: The Asia Foundation, USAID, Center for Advanced Study), 59.
- Di Tommaso, M. L., Shima, I., Strøm, S. and Bettio, F. (2009). "As Bad As It Gets: Well-Being Deprivation of Sexually Exploited Trafficked Women", European Journal of Political Economy, 25, 143-162, doi:10.1016/j.ejpoleco.2008.11.002.
- Duclos, J.-Y. and Araar, A. (2006). "Poverty and Equity: Measurement, Policy and Estimation with DAD", *Economic Studies in Inequality, Social Exclusion and Well-Being, Vol. 2,* Springer & International Development Research Centre, 416.

- Gajic-Veljanoski, O. and Stewart, D. E. (2007). "Women Trafficked into Prostitution: Determinants, Human Rights and Health Needs", *Transcultural Psychiatry*, 44(3), 338-358, doi: 10.1177/1363461507081635.
- Gozdziak, E., Bump, M., Duncan, J., MacDonnell, M. and Loiselle, M. B. (2006). "The Trafficked Child: Trauma and Resilience", *Forced Migration Review*, 14-15.
- Gray, G. G. (2012). "Resilience in Cambodia: Hearing the Voices of Trafficking Survivors and Their Helpers", (Doctoral dissertation, Doctor of Psychology (PsyD), George Fox University) Digital Commons, Paper 80, 85, available online: <u>http://digitalcommons.georgefox.edu</u>.
- Gray, G. G., Luna, L. and Seegobin, W. (2012). "Exploring Resilience: Strengths of Trafficking Survivors in Cambodia", International Journal of Adolescent Medicine and Health, 24(4), 363-371, doi:10.1515/IJAMH.2012.053.
- Hawkins, S. R., Graham, P. W., Williams, J., & Zahn, M. A. (2009). Resilient girls—factors that protect against delinquency. Washington, DC: U.S. Department of Justice: Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention.
- Hossain, M., Zimmerman, C., Abas, M., Light, M., & Watts, C. (2010). The relationship of trauma to mental disorders among trafficked and sexually exploited girls and women. *American Journal of Public Health*, 100(12), 2442-2449.
- Hotaling, N., Burris, A., Johnson, B. J., Bird, Y. M. and Melbye, K. A. (2003). "Been There Done That: SAGE, a Peer Leadership Model among Prostitution Survivors", in *Prostitution, Trafficking, and Traumatic Stress,* edited by Melissa Farley, The Haworth Press, 255-265.
- IOM (2007). The IOM Handbook on Direct Assistance for Victims of Trafficking, IOM/Cooperazione Italiana allo Sviluppo – Ministero degli Affari Esteri, 356.
- Jobe, A. (2010). The Causes and Consequences of Re-Trafficking: Evidence from the IOM Human Trafficking Database, report prepared for the IOM, 80.
- Klika, J. B., & Herrenkohl, T. I. (2013). A review of developmental research on resilience in maltreated children. *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, 1524838013487808.
- Liborio, R. M. C. and Ungar, M. (2010). "Children's Perspectives on their Economic Activity as a Pathway to Resilience", Children & Society, 24, 326-338, doi:10.1111/j.1099-0860.2009.00284.xMiles, G. and Miles, S. (2010). The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project: End of Year Progress Report 2010, Chab Dai Coalition.
- Lisborg, A. (2009). *Re-Thinking Reintegration: What Do Returning Victims Really Want & Need? Evidence from Thailand and the Philippines*, SIREN report, UNIAP – Phase III, 8.
- Masten, A. S. (2014). Global perspectives on resilience in children and youth. *Child development*, 85(1), 6-20.

- McCauley, H. L., Decker, M. R., & Silverman, J. G. (2010). Trafficking experiences and violence victimization of sex-trafficked young women in Cambodia. *International Journal of Gynecology & Obstetrics*, 110(3), 266-267.
- Miles, G. and Miles, S. (2010). *The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project: End of Year Progress Report 2010*, Chab Dai Coalition.
- Miles, G. and Miles, S. (2011). *The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project: End of Year Progress Report 2011*, Chab Dai Coalition.
- Miles, S., Heang, S., Lim, V., Orng L. H., Smith-Brake, J. and Dane, S. (2012). *The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project: End of Year Progress Report 2012,* Chab Dai Coalition.
- Miles, S., Heang, S., Lim, V., Sreang, P. and Dane, S. (2013). *The Butterfly Longitudinal Research Project: End of Year Progress Report 2013*, Chab Dai Coalition.
- Muco, E. (2013). "Trafficking in Human Beings: Paradigms of a Successful Reintegration into Society (Albanian Case)", *European Scientific Journal*, 9(4), 92-117.
- Noltemeyer, A. L. and Bush, K. R. (2013). "Adversity and Resilience: A Synthesis of International Research", School Psychology International, 34(5), 474-487, doi: 10.1177/0143034312472758.
- Nowak-Carter, T. (2012), *Resiliency in Survivors of Human Trafficking: An Explanatory Study of Clinicians' Perspectives on Protective Factors*, thesis for a Master of Social Work, Smith College School for Social Work, 117.
- Nuorteva, P. (2009). *Resilience and Adaptation Strategies of Rural Livelihoods in Tonle Sap area, Cambodia* (Doctoral dissertation, Master's Thesis. Department of Geography, University of Helsinki).
- Oram, S., Stöckl, H., Busza, J., Howard, L. M., & Zimmerman, C. (2012). Prevalence and risk of violence and the physical, mental, and sexual health problems associated with human trafficking: systematic review. *PLoS medicine*, 9(5), e1001224.
- Øverland, G. (2012). *Post traumatic survival: a study of Cambodian resilience*. (Doctoral dissertation, Faculty of humanities and education, University of Agder)
- Reimer, J.K., Langeler, E., Sophea, S., and Montha, S. (2007), 'The Road Home: toward a model of 'reintegration' and considerations for alternative care for children trafficked for sexual exploitation in Cambodia', (Phnom Penh, Cambodia: Hagar/World Vision Cambodia), 84.
- Sandy, L. (2006), "Sex Work in Cambodia: Beyond the Voluntary/Forced Dichotomy", Asian and Pacific Migration Journal, 15(4), 449-469.

- Sandy, L. (2009). " 'Behind Closed Doors': Debt-Bonded Sex Workers in Sihanoukville, Cambodia", *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology*, 10(3), 216-230, doi: 10.1080/14442210903114223.
- Simkhada, P. (2008). "Life Histories and Survival Strategies Amongst Sexually Trafficked Girls in Nepal", *Children & Society*, 22, 235-248, doi:10.1111/j.1099-0860.2008.00154.x.
- Sobon, M. (2015). A Preliminary Perspective for Identifying Resilience and Promoting Growth Among Survivors of Sex Trafficking (Doctoral dissertation, Wright State University).
- Steinfatt, T. M. (2003). *Measuring the Number of Trafficked Women and Children in Cambodia: A Direct Observation Field Study: Part –III of a Series*, USAID, 32.
- Surtees, R. (2012). *Re/Integration of Trafficked Persons: Supporting Economic Empowerment,* Issue Paper #4, Trafficking Victims Re/Integration Programme, King Baudouin Foundation/ Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ) GmbH/NEXUS.
- Surtees, R. (2013). After Trafficking: Experiences and Challenges in the (Re)integration of Trafficked Persons in the Greater Mekong Sub-Region, UNIAP/NEXUS Institute, 256.
- Ungar, M. (2008). "Resilience across Cultures", British Journal of Social Work, 38, 218-235, doi:10.1093/bjsw/bcl343.
- Ungar, M. (2013). "Resilience, Trauma, Context, and Culture", *Trauma, Violence, & Abuse*, 14(3), 255-266, doi: 10.1177/1524838013487805.
- Ungar, M. and Liebenberg, L. (2011). "Assessing Resilience Across Cultures Using Mixed Methods: Construction of the Child and Youth Resilience Measure", *Journal of Mixed Methods Research*, 5(2), 126-149, doi: 10.1177/1558689811400607.
- United Nations (2000) PROTOCOL TO PREVENT, SUPPRESS AND PUNISH TRAFFICKING IN PERSONS, ESPECIALLY WOMEN AND CHILDREN, SUPPLEMENTING THE UNITED NATIONS CONVENTION AGAINST TRANSNATIONAL ORGANIZED CRIME, Article 3 http://www.uncjin.org/Documents/Conventions/dcatoc/final\_documents\_2/convention\_ %20traff\_eng.pdf accessed 23-12-2014
- Werner, E. E. (1993). Risk, resilience, and recovery: Perspectives from the Kauai longitudinal study. *Development and psychopathology*, 5(04), 503-515.
- Yntiso, G., Gebre, A., Shiferaw, R., & Workineh, H. (2014). Learning from Children Exposed to Sexual Abuse and Sexual Exploitation: The Bamboo Project Study on Child Resilience-Resilience in Children Living in Merkato, Ethiopia, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia.
- Zimmerman, C., Hossain, M., Yun, K., Gajdadziev, V., Guzun, N., Tchomarova, M., ... & Watts, C. (2008). The health of trafficked women: a survey of women entering posttrafficking services in Europe. *American Journal of Public Health*, 98(1), 55.

Zimmerman, C., Hossain, M., & Watts, C. (2011). Human trafficking and health: A conceptual model to inform policy, intervention and research. *Social Science & Medicine*, 73(2), 327-335.



### ការបង្ហាញ និងបទពិសោធន៍របស់ជនរងគ្រោះពី៖ ភាពឆាប់ត្រលប់មកធម្មតាវិញ

# របាយការណ៍សិក្សាលើប្រធានបទរួម

# គម្រោងស្រាវជ្រាវមេអំបៅរយៈពេលវែង

ជាគម្រោងស្រាវជ្រាវរបស់អង្គការសម្ព័ន្ធចាប់ដៃអំពីសមាហរណកម្ម ដែលសិក្សាទៅ លើវដ្តជីវិតនៃជន ដែលត្រូវបានគេកេងប្រវ័ញ្ច និងជួញដូរផ្លូវភេទនៅក្នុងប្រទេសកម្ពុជា

របាយការណ៍ ខែធ្នូ ឆ្នាំ២០១៤ អ្នកនិពន្ធ៖ ថដ ម៉ូរីសុន សហការីនិពន្ធ៖ ស៊ីវន ម៉ាលយ៍, ភស្រីឡា ស្កាហ្វ៊ី, ហៀង សុផល, លឹម វណ្ណធារី, ស្រៀង ផល្លី, និងញ៉ាញ់ ចន្តា









## គម្រោងសង្ខេប

**គោលបំណង៖** ការស្រាវជ្រាវរយៈពេលវែងនេះ មានគោលបំណងសិក្សាអំពីការធ្វើសមាហរណកម្ម របស់ជនរួចផុតពីអំពើកេងប្រវ័ព្វ និងជួញដូរផ្លូវភេទក្នុងប្រទេសកម្ពុជា តាមរយៈការសិក្សាតាមដានជន រួចពីរងគ្រោះមួយក្រុមក្នុងរយៈពេល ១០ឆ្នាំ។ គោលបំណងនៃរបាយការណ៍សិក្សានេះគឺ ដើម្បីធ្វើការ ស្វែងយល់ឱ្យបានទូលំទូលាយអំពីភាពឆាប់ជាឡើងវិញ តាមរយៈ "សំលេង" រួមរបស់ជនរួចផុតពីអំពើ កេងប្រវ័ព្វ និងការជួញដូរក្នុងប្រទេសកម្ពុជា។ តាមរយៈការបង្ហាញពី "សំលេង" របស់ពួកគេ និងការ ផ្សព្វផ្សាយអំពីរបកគំហើញនៃការស្រាវជ្រាវនេះ ទាំងនៅក្នុងស្រុក នៅក្នុងតំបន់ និងជាសាកល អង្គការ សម្ព័ន្ធចាប់ដៃជឿជាក់ថា កម្មវិធី និងគោលនយោបាយធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មនានានឹងទទួលបានពត៌មាន ច្រើន និងមានភាពវិវត្តទៅមុខ ដើម្បីជួយឱ្យជីវិតរបស់ជនដែលរួចផុតពីការកេងប្រវ័ព្វផ្លូវភេទ មានភាព ប្រសើរឡើងទាំងនៅក្នុងអាស៊ីអាគ្នេយ៍ និងនៅជុំវិញពិភពលោក។

វិធីសាស្ត្រ៖ ការសិក្សាលើប្រធានបទរួមនេះ បានប្រើប្រាស់ទិន្នន័យដែលបានប្រមូលក្នុងរយៈពេល ៤ ឆ្នាំ ជាប់ៗគ្នា (ពីឆ្នាំ២០១១ ដល់ឆ្នាំ២០១៤) ដោយបានពីការធ្វើបទសម្ភាសន៍ចំនួន ៩៩៤លើក ជាមួយ អតិថិជនចំនួន ១០៩នាក់។ ទិន្នន័យសង្ខេបដែលពាក់ព័ន្ធ ព្រមទាំងពត៌មានលំអិតៗ ក៏ត្រូវបានចងក្រង និងត្រួតពិនិត្យឡើងវិញ ដោយផ្អែកលើប្រធានបទចម្បងទាំង៦ ក្នុងការសិក្សាទាំងមូល។ ប្រធានបទ ទាំងនេះរួមបញ្ចូលនូវចំលើយរបស់អតិថិជន ដែលចូលរួមការសិក្សាស្រាវជ្រាវ អំពីឥរិយាបថ ផ្នត់គំនិត និងបទពិសោធន៍របស់ពួកគេ ទាក់ទងនឹង "ការជឿទុកចិត្ត" "ទំនាក់ទំនង" "បំណុល" "ស្លាកស្នាមទុយ៌ស" "ការរើសអើង" និង"អំពើហិង្សា"។

អតិថិជនទាំងអស់ ត្រូវបានបែងចែកជាក្រុមវាយតម្លៃចំនួន៤ ដោយបែងចែកទៅតាមភេទ និងផ្អែកទៅ លើរយៈពេល ដែលពួកគេស្នាក់ក្នុងកម្មវិធីជំនួយយ៉ាងហោចណាស់ ៤ខែ។ អតិថិជនទាំង៤ក្រុមនោះរួម មាន៖

- ១). ស្ត្រី/ក្មេងស្រី ដែលស្នាក់នៅក្នុងកម្មវិធីជំនួយ តែមិនទាន់ធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មនៅឡើយ (៣២ នាក់)
- ២). ស្ត្រី/ក្មេងស្រី ដែលបានស្នាក់នៅក្នុងកម្មវិធីជំនួយ ហើយបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួចហើយ (៣៤ នាក់),

- ៣). ស្ត្រី/ក្មេងស្រី ដែលមិនបានស្នាក់នៅក្នុងកម្មវិធីជំនួយ តែបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួចហើយ (២៨ នាក់) និង
- ៤). បុរស/ក្មេងប្រុស ដែលបានស្នាក់នៅក្នុងកម្មវិធីជំនួយ ហើយបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួចហើយ (១៥ នាក់)។

**លទ្ធផលនៃការសិក្សា និងសេចក្តីសន្និដ្ឋាន៖** ការបង្ហាញពីភាពឆាប់ត្រលប់មកធម្មតាវិញរបស់ជន រួចពីរងគ្រោះ បានបង្ហាញអំពីសមត្ថភាពក្នុងការសម្របទៅនឹងស្ថានភាពលំបាកៗនៅក្នុងជីវិតរបស់ពួក គេ។ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះបានបង្ហាញពីអារម្មណ៍ស្តីពីសុខុមាលភាពរបស់ពួកគេ ហើយពេលខ្លះក៏បាន បង្ហាញអំពីភាពជំនះតស៊ូនៅពេលមានជួបឧបសគ្គ និងបញ្ហាប្រឈមនានា។

<u>ការវាយតម្លៃរយៈពេលវែង៖</u> ការសិក្សាស្រាវជ្រាវរយៈពេលវែងនេះ ធ្វើការតាមដានអតិថិជន ដែលបាន ចូលរួមក្នុងការសិក្សាស្រាវជ្រាវ តាមរយៈព្រឹត្តិការណ៍សំខាន់ៗ និងបម្រែបម្រូលមួយចំនួន<sup>2</sup> ដែលបាន កើតឡើងនៅក្នុងជីវិតរបស់ពួកគេ។ ទោះបីជាទិន្នន័យនៅក្នុងការសិក្សានេះមានរយៈពេលត្រឹមតែ ៤ឆ្នាំ ដំបូងក៏ដោយ ក៏ប៉ុន្តែនៅពេលដែលយើងបំពេញគ្រប់អាយុនៃគម្រោងនេះរយៈពេល១០ឆ្នាំ យើងនឹង ឃើញថាអតិថិជននៅក្នុងការសិក្សានេះ ស្ទើរតែទាំងអស់នឹងអាចឈានដល់អាយុពេញវ័យ ហើយនិង មានស្ថានភាពប្រែប្រលផ្សេងៗទៀតក៏កំពុងតែកើតឡើងផងដែរ។ ក្នុងរយៈពេលនៃការសិក្សានេះ មាន អតិជនចូលរួមសរុបចំនួន៤៩នាក់ បានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មពីកម្មវិធីជំនួយ បានត្រលប់ទៅសហគមន៍ និងទៅស្នាក់នៅក្នុងផ្ទះ/មណ្ឌលបណ្តោះអាសន្ន។ ទាំងជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ ដែលបានចូលរៀននៅសាលា រៀនវិញ ឬបានចាប់ផ្តើមវគ្គសិក្សាបណ្តុះបណ្តាលការងារ និងជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ ដែលបានចូលរៀននៅសាលា រៀនវិញ ឬបានចាប់ផ្តើមវគ្គសិក្សាបណ្តុះបណ្តាលការងារ និងជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ ដែលបានចូលរៀននៅសាលា រៀនវិញ ឬបានចាប់ផ្តើមវគ្គសិក្សាបណ្តុះបណ្តាលការងារ និងជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ ដែលបានចូលរៀននៅសាលា ឆ្វើនៅក្នុងសហគមន៍។ ការវិវត្តនៃភាពចាស់មុំ និងការធ្វើការសម្រេចចិត្តទាក់ទងនឹងផែនការណ៍ ទំនាក់ ទំនងក្នុងជីវិត និងការរៀនរស់នៅដោយខ្លួនឯង សុទ្ធសឹងតែជាប្រធានបទដែលជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះបាន លើកមកពិភាក្សាក្នុងការសិក្សានេះ នៅពេល០ពួកគេ ឆ្លងកាត់ស្ថានភាពអន្តរកាលទាំងនេះ។

អាពាហ៍ពិពាហ៍គឺជាព្រឹត្តិការណ៍សង្គមមួយដ៏សំខាន់ ដែលអតិថិជនភាគច្រើនមិនទាន់បានឆ្លងកាត់នៅ ឡើយ។ នៅក្នុងការសិក្សានេះមានអតិថិជនភាគច្រើនជាអ្នកនៅលីវ ចំនួនប្រហែលជា ៩០នាក់ ក្នុង

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> ដំណើរចរនៃជីវិតសំខាន់ៗរួមមានព្រឹត្តការណ៍ផ្សេងៗ ដូចជាការរៀបអាពាហ៍ពិពាហ៍, ការបញ្ចប់ការសិក្សាពីសាលា ឬការទទួល បានវគ្គវឹកហាត់ការងារ, ឬការមានកូន។ ការផ្លាស់ប្តូរនានា រួមមាន ការផ្លាស់ប្តូរសំខាន់ៗក្នុងជីវិតរបស់មនុស្សម្នាក់ៗ ដូចជាការ ឈានចូលវ័យកណ្តាល និងការធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មសំរាប់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ (សូមមើល ផ្នែកទី ៤.១ សំរាប់ព៌តមានបន្ថែម)។

ចំណោមអតិថិជនទាំងអស់ចំនួន ១០៩នាក់ ដែលបានចូលរួមក្នុងការវាយតម្លៃក្នុងឆ្នាំ២០១៤ នេះ។ នៅ ពេលយើងសាកសួរពួកគេ អតិថិជនស្ទើរតែទាំងអស់បានសម្តែងអារម្មណ៍ថា នៅពេលណាមួយពួកគេ មានបំណងចង់បានប្តី ដែលមានភាពស្មោះត្រង់ ចេះជួយយកអាសារ និងចង់ចាប់ផ្តើមគ្រូសារជាមួយ គ្នា។ យ៉ាងណាមិញ ស្ថានភាពអន្តរកាលនេះគឺជាផ្លូវមួយដ៏លំបាកសម្រាប់ជីវិតរបស់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ ភាគច្រើនឆ្លងកាត់ ព្រោះពួកគេត្រូវប្រឈមនឹងបញ្ហានៃការមាក់ងាយពីសង្គម ការប្រព្រឹត្តតាមការរំពឹង ទុករបស់គ្រូសារ និងការផ្សារភ្ជាប់នូវទស្សនៈខុសគ្នាពីមួយជំនាន់ទៅមួយជំនាន់ ដែលសុទ្ធសឹងតែជា បញ្ហាធ្វើឱ្យមានភាពស្មុគស្មាញកាន់តែខ្លាំង។ សមត្ថភាពក្នុងការបណ្តុះនូវទំនាក់ទំនងជាមួយគូរស្រករ ដែលអាចផ្តល់ការគាំទ្រ និងលើកទឹកចិត្ត របស់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះទាំងនេះ អាចនឹងបង្ហាញឱ្យឃើញថា ការសម្រេចចិត្តនានាជាច្រើនក្នុងការជ្រើសរើសគូរស្រករនេះ អាចក្លាយជាចំនុចឡើងចុះសំខាន់ៗជា វិជ្ជមាន ឬអវិជ្ជមាននៅក្នុងជីវិតរបស់ពួកគេ។

<u>ទំនាក់ទំនង៖</u> ភាគច្រើននៃអតិថិជន ដែលបានរៀបការរួចហើយ កំពុងតែជួបប្រទះបញ្ហាក្នុងការទំនាក់ ទំនងជាមួយគូរស្រករ និងឪពុកម្តាយក្មេករបស់ពួកគេ។ នៅក្នុងចំណោមអតិថិជន មានអាយុចាស់ជាង គេបំផុត១៩នាក់ ដែលបានរៀបការរួច ឬស្ថិតក្នុងទំនាក់ទំនងដៃគូររយៈពេលវែង មាន១៥នាក់ បាន រៀបរាប់អំពីទំនាក់ទំនងមិនល្អជាមួយមិត្តប្រុស ឬប្តី និង/ឬឪពុកម្តាយខាងប្តី នៅពេលយើងធ្វើការ សម្ភាសន៍ពួកគេកាលពីឆ្នាំមុន។ ហើយក្នុងចំណោមអតិថិជនទាំង១៥នាក់នោះ មាន០៩នាក់ បាន រៀបរាប់អំពីស្ថានភាពអវិជ្ជមាន ដែលកើតឡើងក្នុងរយៈពេល ២ឆ្នាំ ឬច្រើនឆ្នាំជាប់ៗគ្នា។ អតិថិជនភាគ ប្រើននិយាយអំពីការរស់នៅជាមួយបងប្អូនសាច់ថ្លៃរបស់ពួកគេបន្ទាប់ពីរៀបការរួច ហើយបាននិយាយ អំពីបញ្ហាពិបាកៗមួយចំនួនក្នុងការសម្របខ្លួនទៅនឹងគ្រួសារថ្មី។ គួរឱ្យសោកស្តាយ អតិថិជនជាច្រើន បាននិយាយអំពីការស៊ូទ្រាំរយៈពេលជាច្រើនឆ្នាំរបស់ពួកគេ ចំពោះអំពើហិង្សាលើរាងកាយដោយសារ បញ្ហាគ្រឿងស្រវឹង ការរំលោភបំពានផ្លូវអារម្មណ៍ ការគំរាមកំហែងលើរាងកាយ ភាពមិនស្មោះត្រង់ ការ ញៀនគ្រឿងញៀន និងការបោះបង់ចោលពីសំណាក់ប្តី ឬមិត្តប្រុស និងគ្រួសារសាច់ថ្លៃរបស់ពួកគេ។ ទោះបីជាការសិក្សានេះមានអតិថិជនតិចតួច ដែលបានរៀបការហើយក៏ដោយ ក៏ពួកគេនៅតែបានជួប ប្រទះបញ្ហាពិបាកស្រដៀងគ្នាដែរ ក្នុងការបង្កើតចំណងអាពាហ៍ពិពាហ៍ ដែលចេះលើកទឹកចិត្ត និងជួយ គ្នាទេវរិញទៅមក។ ខាងក្រោមជាពាក្យសម្តីដែលជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ បាននិយាយរៀបរាប់ពីបទពិសោធន៍ របស់ពួកគេ៖

- ⇒ ប្រុសៗបានបោកប្រាស់ខ្ញុំម្តងហើយម្តងទៀត។ ខ្ញុំមិនចង់មានទំនាក់ទំនងជាមួយមនុស្សប្រុស ទៀតទេ ព្រោះការស្រលាញ់បែបនេះធ្វើអោយខ្ញុំខូចចិត្ត និងឈឺចិត្តយ៉ាងខ្លាំង។ -ស្ត្រីរួចពីរង គ្រោះ អាយុ២៣ឆ្នាំ និយាយពីបទពិសោធន៍នេះក្នុងឆ្នាំ២០១៣។

ទំនាក់ទំនងជាមួយម្តាយគឺជាទំនាក់ទំនងគ្រូសារដ៏សំខាន់បំផុត ដែលបាននិយាយបញ្ជាក់ដោយអតិថិជន វ័យក្មេងមួយចំនួន ដែលកំពុងរស់នៅក្នុងមណ្ឌល និងក្នុងសហគមន៍។ ទំនាក់ទំនងល្អរវាងម្តាយជាមួយ និងជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះវ័យក្មេង អាចមានឥទ្ធិពលជាវិជ្ជមាន ដែលគួរឱ្យកត់សម្គាល់ចំពោះភាពឆាប់ត្រលប់ ជាធម្មតាវិញរបស់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ ក៏ដូចជាជួយពួកគេនៅពេលក្លាយជាយុវវ័យ។ អតិថិជនមួយចំនួន និយាយពីចំនុចនេះដូចខាងក្រោម៖

- ទោះបីជាគ្រូសារខ្ញុំក្រ ប៉ុន្តែពួកយើងរស់នៅជាមួយគ្នាយ៉ាងសប្បាយដោយមិនដែលមានការ ឈ្លោះទាស់ទៃងគ្នាទេ។ -ស្ត្រីរួចពីរងគ្រោះ អាយុ១៩ឆ្នាំ និយាយពីបទពិសោធន៍នេះក្នុងឆ្នាំ ២០១៣។
- ភាល់ពេលដែលខ្ញុំមានបញ្ហា ម្តាយរបស់ខ្ញុំតែងតែលួងលោមខ្ញុំ។ ខ្ញុំទុកចិត្តឪពុកម្តាយខ្ញុំជាងគេ បំផុត។ -ស្ត្រីរួចពីរងគ្រោះ អាយុ១៦ឆ្នាំ និយាយពីបទពិសោធន៍នេះក្នុងឆ្នាំ២០១៣។

ប៉ុន្តែទោះជាយ៉ាងណាក៏ដោយ បញ្ហាគ្រូសារ និងបញ្ហាទំនាក់ទំនងតែងតែកើតឡើងមិនចេះដាច់ ហើយក៏ ជាប្រធានមួយ ដែលបានលើកមកសិក្សាជាប្រចាំពីមួយឆ្នាំទៅមួយឆ្នាំ ជាមួយអតិថិជនដែលបានធ្វើសមា ហរណកម្ម។ នៅពេលសមាហរណកម្ម អតិថិជនស្រីៗតែងតែនិយាយអំពីជំលោះជាមួយគ្រួសារ ដែល កើតចេញពីភាពមិនចុះសម្រងគ្នា ទៅលើទំនាក់ទំនងជាមួយមិត្តប្រុស/ដៃគូរ និងការរៀបការដោយការ ផ្សំផ្គុំពីឪពុកម្តាយ។ នៅក្នុងស្ថានភាពខ្លះ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះមួយចំនួនធ្វើឱ្យខ្លួនឯងប្រឈមហានិភ័យនឹង អំពើហិង្សាក្នុងគ្រួសារ ដោយសារតែពួកគេជ្រើសរើសបន្តទំនាក់ទំនងស្នេហា ដោយគ្មានការយល់ព្រមពី គ្រូសារ (ពីគ្រួសារផ្ទាល់ខ្លួន ឬគ្រួសាររបស់មិត្តប្រុស)។

<u>កា<mark>ររើសអើង និងបទពិសោធន៍សមាហរណកម្មនៅក្នុងសហគមន៍៖</mark> បញ្ហាដ៏ធ្ងន់ធ្ងរមួយ ដែលស្ត្រីរួចពីរង គ្រោះស្ទើរតែពាក់កណ្តាលបានជួបប្រទះ គឺការរើសអើងបន្ទាប់ពីពួកគេបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួច ដែល</u> យ៉ាងហោចណាស់ ពួកគេបានជួបប្រទះម្តងក្នុងអំឡុងពេលវាយតម្លៃនេះ។ ក្នុងអំឡុងពេល៤ឆ្នាំដែល បានដាក់បញ្ចូលក្នុងការសិក្សានេះ អតិថិជនរៀបរាប់ថា ពួកគេទទួលការរើសអើងដោយសារបទ ពិសោធន៍ពីអតីតកាលរបស់ពួកគេពីសំណាក់ប្តី ឬដៃគូររយៈពេលវែង និងសមាជិកគ្រួសាររបស់ពួកគេ រហូតដល់ក្រុមដែលមានវ័យស្របាលគ្នាជាមួយពួកគេ និងពីសំណាក់បណ្តាមនុស្សម្នានៅក្នុងសង្គមទូទៅ ដូចជាគ្របង្រៀន និងអ្នកជិតខាង។ អ្នកជិតខាង សិស្សរៀនជាមួយគ្នា និងគ្រួសារសាច់ថ្លៃក៏បាន រើសអើង និងមាក់ងាយដល់អតិថិជនមួយចំនួនដោយសារភាពក្រីក្រ ឬដោយសារពួកគេមកពីគ្រួសារក្រី ក្រ។ ជាក់ស្តែង អតិថិជននៅសាលាបានរៀបរាប់ប្រាប់ថា ការរើសអើង និងការធ្វើបុរេនិច្ឆ័យទៅលើក្មេង ស្រី ដែលស្នាក់នៅក្នុងមណ្ឌល ពីសំណាក់មិត្តភក្តិរួមថ្នាក់របស់ពួកគេ (ករណីនេះកើតឡើងចំពោះអតិថិ ជនក្នុងកម្មវិធីជំនួយស្នាក់នៅក្នុងមណ្ឌល និងអតិថិជនធ្វើសមាហរកម្មរួច ដែលស្ថិតក្នុងការតាមដាន)។ សិស្សស្រីម្នាក់បាននិយាយពីបទពិសោធន៍នៅក្នុងសាលារបស់នាងបែបនេះថា៖

⇒ មិត្តភក្តិនៅសាលារៀនធ្វើអោយខ្ញុំមិនសប្បាយចិត្ត ដោយសារពួកគេចូលចិត្តបង្អាប់ខ្ញុំ និង និយាយពាក្យសម្តីរអាក្រក់ពីខ្ញុំ។ ខ្ញុំគិតថាពួកគេរើសអើងខ្ញុំដោយសារពួកគេដឹងថាខ្ញុំធ្លាប់ស្នាក់ នៅមណ្ឌល។ ពួកគេនិយាយថា ក្មេងមណ្ឌល ជាក្មេងដែលត្រូវគេកេងប្រវ័ព្វាផ្លូវភេទ និងចាប់ រំលោភរហូតដល់មានកូនដោយមិនមានប្តី។ -ក្មេងស្រីរួចពីរងគ្រោះ អាយុ១៣ឆ្នាំ រៀបរាប់ពីបទ ពិសោធន៍នៅឆ្នាំ២០១២។

គួរចាប់អារម្មណ៍ថា ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះជាបុរស/ក្មេងប្រុសមិនបានបង្ហាញពីអារម្មណ៍ថាពួកគេទទួលការ រើសអើងពីសំណាក់គ្រូសារ ឬសហគមន៍របស់ពួកគេទេ។ អតិថិជនជាបុរស/ក្មេងប្រុសភាគច្រើនបាន រៀបរាប់ពីបទពិសោធន៍ល្អៗ ដែលពួកគេមានជាមួយអ្នកជិតខាង និងមិត្តភក្ភិរួមការងារនៅក្នុងសហគមន៍ បន្ទាប់ពីពួកគេបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្ម។ អតិថិជនមួយចំនួនបានរៀបរាប់ពីជម្លោះ/បញ្ហាជាមួយនឹងអ្នក គ្រប់គ្រងនៅកន្លែងធ្វើការ និងការវាយគ្នាជាមួយអ្នកជិតខាងរបស់ពួកគេផងដែរ ប៉ុន្តែពួកគេមិនបានគិត ថាបញ្ហាទាំងអស់នេះ ជាការមាក់ងាយ ឬការរើសអើងនោះទេ។ ការវាយតម្លៃនេះ ចំនួនសំណាកមាន កម្រិត គឺមានទំហំសំណាកតូច (១៥នាក់)។ ហេតុដូច្នេះហើយ ការសិក្សានៅពេលអនាគតគួរតែមានការ ស្វែងរកលំអិតចំពោះការរើសអើងរបស់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះជាបុរស/ក្មេងប្រុសនៅក្នុងសហគមន៍។

ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះជាស្ត្រី/ក្មេងស្រី បានបង្ហាញអំពីបទពិសោធន៍ នៅក្នុងសហគមន៍ជាមួយអ្នកជិតខាង មិត្ត ភក្កិ និងអ្នករួមការងារ ទាំងបទពិសោធន៍វិជ្ជមាន និងអវិជ្ជមាន។ បន្ទាប់ពីធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មហើយ ជន រួចពីរងគ្រោះមួយចំនួនបាននិយាយពីពេលវេលា ដែលពួកគេចំណាយដើម្បីបង្កើតមិត្តភក្កិ និងកសាង ទំនាក់ទំនង ដែលអាចចេះជួយគ្នាទៅវិញទៅមកក្នុងសហគមន៍។ អ្នកខ្លះបាននិយាយពីម្ចាស់ផ្ទះជួល មានចិត្តល្អ និងការគាំទ្រពីសំណាក់អ្នកដឹកនាំនៅក្នុងឃុំ/សង្កាត់របស់ពួកគេ។ ស្របពេលជាមួយគ្នានោះ ដែរ អ្វីដែលគួរឱ្យកត់សម្គាល់គឺ មានអតិថិជនមួយចំនួនបានលាក់រឿងពីអតីតកាលរបស់ពួកគេជាការ សម្ងាត់ពីមិត្តរួមការងារ អ្នកជិតខាង ហើយសូម្បីតែប្តី និងសមាជិកគ្រួសាររបស់ពួកគេផងដែរ។ អតិថិជន ដែលមានវ័យចំណាស់និយាយរៀបរាប់ពីជម្លោះ និងការរើសអើងនៅក្នុងសហគមន៍របស់ពួកគេពី សំណាក់អ្នកជិតខាង និងអ្នករួមការងារ ដែលបានកើតឡើងអស់ជាច្រើនឆ្នាំមកហើយ។ ការថ្លាស់ប្តូរទី កន្លែងរស់នៅ និងការងាររបស់អតិថិជនមួយចំនួន ជាធម្មតាមិនបានធ្វើឱ្យស្ថានភាពនេះល្អប្រសើរវិញ ឡើយ វាមើលទៅហាក់ដូចជាចងអតិថិជនមួយចំនួន ជាធម្មតាមិនបានធ្វើឱ្យស្ថានភាពនេះល្អប្រសើរវិញ ឡើយ វាមើលទៅហាក់ដូចជាចងអតិថិជនមួយចំនួន ជាធម្មតាមិនបានធ្វើឱ្យស្ថានភាពនេះល្អប្រសើរវិញ អ្នកជិតខាង និងអ្នករួមការងាររបស់ពួកគេនៅគ្រប់កន្លែង ដែលពួកគេបានទៅដល់។ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ ក្នុងវ័យកណ្តាលម្នាក់បានចែករំលែកបទពិសោធន៍ទាក់ទងនឹងការរើសអើងនៅក្នុងសហគមន៍ពីសំណាក់ មិត្តរួមការងារតាមបែបដូចខាងក្រោម៖

ឆ្លកគេចាប់ផ្តើមឈប់និយាយរកខ្ញុំ នៅពេលពួកគេបានដឹងពីអតីតកាលរបស់ខ្ញុំ។ ពួកគេយល់ ច្រឡំលើខ្ញុំ ហើយពួកគេលែងចាត់ទុកថាខ្ញុំជាមនុស្សល្អទៀតហើយ។ ពួកគេបាននិយាយរឿង របស់ខ្ញុំទៅប្រាប់អ្នកចូលថ្មី ដែលទើបមកធ្វើការជាមួយពួកយើង។ -ស្ត្រីរួចពីរងគ្រោះ អាយុ២៧ ឆ្នាំ និយាយពីបទពិសោធន៍នេះក្នុងឆ្នាំ ២០១២។

កត្តារុញច្រាន <sup>3</sup> ៖ កត្តារុញច្រាននៅក្នុងសិក្សានេះត្រូវបានធ្វើការប៉ាន់ប្រមាណដោយសារកត្តាជាច្រើន មានការទាក់ទងនឹងការធ្វើសេចក្តីសម្រេចចិត្ត និងបទពិសោធន៍ជីវិតរបស់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះទៅលើការ ចាប់ផ្តើមកម្មវិធីវគ្គបណ្តុះបណ្តាល និងការឈប់ពីកម្មវិធីវគ្គបណ្តុះបណ្តាលការងារ ការចាប់ផ្តើមធ្វើការ និងឈប់ធ្វើការជាច្រើនកន្លែង ការផ្លាស់ប្តូរទីកន្លែងរស់នៅក្នុងប្រទេសកម្ពុជា និងការធ្វើចំណាកស្រុកទៅ ប្រទេសដទៃដើម្បីស្វែងរកឱកាសការងារល្អប្រសើរជាងមុន និងការបង្កើតគ្រូសារថ្មីឡើងវិញជាដើម។ ជាញឹកញាប់ អតិថិជននិយាយរៀបរាប់ពីការសម្រេចចិត្តជាច្រើន និងការណីផ្លាស់ប្តូរទីកន្លែងជាច្រើនដង ច្រើនសារ អំឡុកពេលប៉ុន្មានឆ្នាំកន្លងមកនៅក្នុងការសិក្សានេះ។ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះបានបង្ហាញនូវប្រធាន ប្រធានបទរួមធំៗចំនួន១៣ចំនុច ដែលដើរតួជាកត្តារុញច្រានក្នុងជីវិតរបស់ពួកគេ។ អតិថិជនភាគច្រើន

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> កត្តារុញប្រានទាំងឡាយ គឺជាប្រជានបទរួម ដែលកើតឡើងជារឿយៗ ដែលជាសកម្មភាពដើម្បីជំរុញមនុស្ស ឱ្យនៅឆ្ងាយពីលំនៅ ដ្ឋាន និង/ឬការងារ(កត្តាជំរុញ) និងទាក់ទាញមនុស្សឱ្យទៅរកលំនៅស្ថាន និង/ឬកន្លែងការងារថ្មី(កត្តាប្រាន) (សូមមើលផ្នែកទី ៤.៤ សម្រាប់ពត៌មានលំអិតបន្ថែម)។

និយាយអំពីបញ្ហាបំណុល ប្រាក់ចំណូលមិនគ្រប់គ្រាន់ និងកាតព្វកិច្ចត្រូវផ្គត់ផ្គង់គ្រួសារ។ អតិថិជនក្នុង មណ្ឌលមិនសូវបាននិយាយពីប្រធានបទរួមចំនួន៥ចំនុច ដែលចំនុចទាំងនេះក្លាយជាប្រធានបទរួម សំខាន់សម្រាប់អតិថិជនភាគច្រើន ដែលបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្ម (ប្រធានបទរួមទាំង៥នោះរួមមាន៖ បញ្ហាគ្មានការងារធ្វើ បញ្ហាសុខភាពគ្រួសារ ការមានផ្ទៃពោះ ការរើសអើងមាក់ងាយនៅក្នុងសហគមន៍ និងឱកាសទទួលបានការងារ ដែលសមរម្យជាងមុន)។

ការព្យាយាមស្វែងរកឱកាសលើកកម្ពស់កម្រិតជីវភាព គឺជាកត្តាជំរុញមួយដ៏សំខាន់ផងដែរ និងក៏ជាក្តី បារម្ភមួយ ដែលតែងតែកើតមានសម្រាប់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ និងគ្រួសាររបស់ពួកគេ។ ការសិក្សានេះ បង្ហាញថា មានគ្រួសារអតិថិជនភាគច្រើនមានការលំបាកក្នុងការរកប្រាក់ចំណូលគ្រប់គ្រាន់សម្រាប់ផ្តត់ ផ្គង់ការរស់នៅ។ មានគ្រួសារមួយចំនួនបានធ្វើចំណាកស្រុកទៅប្រទេសថៃ ដើម្បីស្វែងរកការងារធ្វើ។ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះជាបុរស/ក្មេងប្រុសភាគច្រើនបារម្ភពីបញ្ហាថវិការ(លុយ) ហើយជនរួចពីរភាពងគ្រោះ មួយចំនួនទៀតនិយាយពីអារម្មណ៍ឯកោ និងអារម្មណ៍ត្រូវគេបោះបង់នៅពេល ដែលម្តាយរបស់ពួកគេ ចាកចេញពីពួកគេទៅស្វែងរកការងារធ្វើនៅប្រទេសថៃ។ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះម្នាក់បាននិយាយថា៖

⇒ ប្រសិនបើអ្នកមិនយកខ្ញុំទៅថៃជាមួយអ្នក(ម្តាយ) ខ្ញុំនឹងមិនញុាំបាយ និងឈប់ទៅសាលារៀន ទៀតហើយ។ ខ្ញុំនឹងគិតតែពីជិះកង់លេងជុំវិញភូមិ ហើយនឹងព្យាយាមបង្ករបញ្ហានានា។ ខ្ញុំចង់ រស់នៅជាមួយម្តាយខ្ញុំ។ -ក្មេងប្រុសរួចពីរងគ្រោះអាយុ១៤ឆ្នាំ និយាយនៅឆ្នាំ២០១៤។

ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះមួយចំនួនតូច បាននិយាយពីការប្រសើរឡើងនៃស្ថានភាពហិរញ្ញវត្ថុរបស់ពួកគេ។ ជន រួចពីរងគ្រោះភាគច្រើន ដែលមានប្រាក់ចំណូលសមរម្យក៏បាននិយាយពីចំណុចនេះដែរ ដោយសារនៅ ក្នុងគ្រូសាររបស់គេមានសមាជិកច្រើនជាងម្នាក់ ជួយរកប្រាក់ផ្គត់ផ្គង់គ្រូសារ។ អតិថិជនដែលបាន បញ្ជាក់ថាពួកគេមានប្រាក់ចំណូលគ្រប់គ្រាន់ ដែលអាចផ្គត់ផ្គង់តម្រូវការគ្រូសាររបស់ពួកគេបាន ភាគ ច្រើនគឺជាអតិថិជន ដែលនៅធ្វើការជាមួយអង្កការ ឬក៏កម្មវិធីជំនួយ។ ការងារជាអ្នកសម្អាតនៅក្នុងវិស័យ បដិសណ្ឋារកិច្ច និងអ្នកគ្រប់គ្រងនៅក្នុងវិស័យរោងចក្រ គឺជាមុខតំណែងពីរនៅក្នុងវិស័យឧស្សាកម្មឯក ជន ដែលជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះកំពុងធ្វើការងារនៅទីនោះយ៉ាងរលូន និងទទួលបានប្រាក់ចំណូលសមរម្យ សម្រាប់គ្រូសាររបស់ពួកគេ។ អតិថិជនម្នាក់បាននិយាយរៀបរាប់ពីការងាររបស់នាងនៅក្នុងវិស័យរោង ចក្រក្នុងឆ្នាំ២០១៣ និងឆ្នាំ២០១៤៖

- ⇒ នៅកន្លែងធ្វើការរបស់ខ្ញុំ ពួកគេបានតម្លើងតំណែងខ្ញុំឱ្យធ្វើជាប្រធានក្រុម។ ប្រាក់ខែរបស់ខ្ញុំក៏ បានតម្លើងដែរ។ -ស្ត្រីរួចពីរងគ្រោះអាយុ២២ឆ្នាំ និយាយក្នុងឆ្នាំ២០១៤។

ការបង្ហាញអំពីសុខុមាលភាព៖ អតិថិជនទាំងពីរក្រុម (ទាំងអ្នកនៅក្នុងកម្មវិធីស្នាក់នៅមណ្ឌល និងក្រុម ដែលបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួចហើយ) បានបង្ហាញពីអារម្មណ៍ពេញចិត្ត និងសប្បាយរីករាយទៅនឹង់អ្វី ដែលពួកគេមាននៅក្នុងជីវិត។ អតិថិជនក៏បានបង្ហាញពីការព្រួយបារម្ភនៅក្នុងជីវិតរបស់ពួកគេដែរ។ បញ្ហាការព្រួយបារម្ភផ្សេងៗនៅក្នុងកម្មវិធីស្នាក់នៅមណ្ឌលរួមមាន៖ ការព្រួយបារម្ភពីសមាជិកគ្រួសារនៅ ផ្ទះ ការធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មនៅពេលអនាគត ការសិក្សា/សាលារៀន និងរឿងក្តីនៅពុលាការទាក់ទងនឹង ករណីរបស់ពួកគេជាដើម។ ចំពោះអ្នកដែលបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួចហើយ ច្រើនតែមានការព្រួយ បារម្ភអំពីការរក្សាតុល្យភាពក្នុងជីវិត ព្រោះវាទាក់ទងនឹងបញ្ហាជំងឺ បំណុល ការស្វែងរកប្រាក់ចំណូលឱ្យ បារម្ភអំពីការរក្សាតុល្យភាពក្នុងជីវិត ព្រោះវាទាក់ទងនឹងបញ្ហាជំងឺ បំណុល ការស្វែងរកប្រាក់ចំណូលឱ្យ បានគ្រប់គ្រាន់ ដើម្បីផ្តត់ផ្គង់ការរស់នៅ ការស្វែងរកប្រាក់ចំណូលក្នុងពេលកំពុងរៀន ឬទទួលវគ្គបណ្តុះ បណ្តាល បញ្ហាគ្មានការងារធ្វើ និងការមានកូនជាដើម។ អតិថិជនភាគច្រើនបានបង្ហាញថា ពួកគេមាន ជីវិតរស់នៅល្អប្រសើរក្នុងមណ្ឌលស្នាក់នៅ ហើយបាននិយាយអំពីសេចក្តីស្រលាញ់ ដែលពួកគេបាន ទទួលពីបុគ្គលិកមណ្ឌល និងម្តាយថែទាំ។ បន្ទាប់ពីធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួច ជនរួចផុតពីរងគ្រោះជាច្រើន និយាយថា ពួកគេបានសម្របខ្លួនរបស់ពួកគេទៅនឹងជីវិតនៅខាងក្រៅច្រើន ព្រោះជីរិតនៅខាងក្រោ មណ្ឌលជួលការពិបាកច្រើនជាងនៅក្នុងមណ្ឌល។

គ្មានអតិថិជនណាមួយនិយាយអំពីអារម្មណ៍ពេញចិត្ត និងសប្បាយរីករាយទេ ប្រសិនបើពួកគេមាន អារម្មណ៍ថា ទំនាក់ទំនងគ្រសារមានភាពអវិជ្ជមាន ក្នុងជីវិតបច្ចុប្បន្នរបស់ពួកគេ។ មានតែ ២ករណី ប៉ុណ្ណោះដែលជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះបានបង្ហាញពីអារម្មណ៍សប្បាយ និងអារម្មណ៍ពេញចិត្តជាមួយនឹងការរស់ នៅក្នុងសហគមន៍ ខណៈដែលពួកគេកំពុងជួបប្រទះការលំបាកក្នុងការរកប្រាក់ចំណូល ហើយមានតែ ៤ ករណីប៉ុណ្ណោះ ដែលអតិថិជនបានបង្ហាញពីអារម្មណ៍សប្បាយរីករាយ បើទោះបីជាពួកគេកំពុងជួបប្រទះ នូវបទពិសោធន៍នៃការរើសអើងក៏ដោយ។ គ្មានអតិថិជនណាមួយបង្ហាញពីអារម្មណ៍ពេញចិត្ត និង សប្បាយចិត្តទេ នៅពេលដែលពួកគេមានទំនាក់ទំនងគ្រុសារមិនល្អនៅក្នុងជីវិតរបស់ពួកគេ។ លទ្ធផល នេះបង្ហាញថា បញ្ហាទាំងបីនេះបានដើរតួយ៉ាងសំខាន់ក្នុងការកំណត់ពីសុខុមាលភាព និងភាពឆាប់ ត្រលប់មកធម្មតាវិញ របស់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះនៅក្នុងសហគមន៍។ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះម្នាក់បាននិយាយអំពី ការលំបាកដែលនាងបានជួបប្រទះជាមួយនឹងប្តី ដែលធ្វើបាបរំលោភបំពាន និងការមិនមានទំនាក់ទំនង គ្រូសារល្អផ្សេងៗទៀតនៅក្នុងជីវិតរបស់នាងក្នុងរយៈពេល៣ឆ្នាំ៖

⇒ ខ្ញុំមិនដែលមានអារម្មណ៍សប្បាយចិត្ត ឬមានសុភមង្គលម្កងណាទេ តាំងពីខ្ញុំបានរៀបការជាមួយ ប្តីខ្ញុំ។ គាត់មិនដែលឱ្យលុយខ្ញុំសម្រាប់ផ្តត់ផ្គង់គ្រូសារទេ។ ខ្ញុំត្រូវតែដើររកបេះបន្លែនៅជុំវិញផ្ទះ សម្រាប់ធ្វើម្ហូប ខ្ញុំចង់បែកពីប្តីរបស់ខ្ញុំ និងយកកូនខ្ញុំទៅជាមួយ ប៉ុន្តែប្តីខ្ញុំ និងគ្រូសារប្តីខ្ញុំបាន និយាយថា ខ្ញុំអាចចេញទៅបាន តែមិនអាចយកកូនខ្ញុំទៅជាមួយទេ។ ខ្ញុំត្រូវទុកកូននៅជាមួយ ពួកគេ។ -ស្ត្រីរួចពីរងគ្រោះ អាយុ២០ឆ្នាំ និយាយក្នុងឆ្នាំ២០១៤។

ការធ្វើសេចក្តីសម្រេចចិត្តក្នុងសហគមន៍៖ នៅពេលជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មត្រលប់ទៅ រស់នៅក្នុងសហគមន៍វិញ នោះការធ្វើការសម្រេចចិត្ត និងរចនាសម្ព័ន្ធក្នុងការសម្រេចចិត្ត ត្រូវបានផ្លាស់ ប្តូរទៅអោយឪពុកម្តាយ ឬគ្រូសាររបស់ពួកគេ និង/ឬអតិថិជនខ្លួនឯងផ្ទាល់តែម្តង។ អតិថិជនក្មេងៗ ដែលបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួចហើយមួយចំនួន បាននិយាយថា ឪពុកម្តាយរបស់ពួកគេបានចូលរួមក្នុង ដំណើរការនេះ តាមរយៈការផ្តល់ឱ្យពួកគេមាននូវសេរីភាពច្រើន ឬតិចជាង។ ជាទូទៅ នៅក្នុងចំណោម ក្រុមអតិថិជនទាំងអស់ អតិថិជនជាបុរស/ក្មេងប្រុសភាគច្រើន មានការលំបាកក្នុងការធ្វើសេចក្តីសម្រេច ចិត្តអោយបានល្អទាក់ទងនឹងគ្រឿងញៀន/គ្រឿងស្រវឹង ចំណែកឯអតិថិជនជាស្ត្រី/ក្មេងស្រីវិញភាគច្រើន ជួបបញ្ហាលំបាកក្នុងការសម្រេចចិត្តទាក់ទងនឹងជម្រើសក្នុងការទំនាក់ទំនង និងបញ្ហាអំពើហិង្សានៅក្នុង គ្រូសារ។ អតិថិជនដែលស្ថិតក្នុងក្រុមចន្លោះអាយុច្រើន(ចំណាស់) និយាយរៀបរាប់អំពីការធ្វើការ សម្រេចចិត្តដោយឯករាជ្យ ដែលអាចប្រឈមនឹងហានិភ័យខ្ពស់។ ជាទូទៅ ទំនាក់ទំនងជាមួយនឹងឪពុក ម្តាយ ទំនងជានឹងមានឥទ្ធិពល(មិនថាឥទ្ធិពលអាក្រក់ ឬល្អ) ទៅលើការសម្រេចចិត្ត និងការកសាង ទំនាក់ទំនង សម្រាប់ក្រុមអតិថិជនមួយភាគធំ នៅពេលពួកគេលូតលាស់ក្លាយជាយុវវ័យ។

កាសិក្សារយៈវែងនេះផ្តល់នូវឱកាសដើម្បីស្វែងយល់កាន់តែច្បាស់ថែមទៀត អំពីកត្តារុញច្រានផ្សេងៗ នៅកន្លែងធ្វើការក្នុងជីវិតរបស់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះ។ នៅក្នុងការសិក្សានេះ យើងមើលឃើញច្បាស់ថា ការ ធ្វើសេចក្តីសម្រេចចិត្តរបស់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះមានភាពស្មុគស្មាញ ហើយការសម្រេចចិត្តទាំងនេះមិនមែន ត្រឹមតែទាក់ទងនឹងការរកប្រាក់ចំណូលប៉ុណ្ណោះទេ។ ក្នុងការសិក្សារយៈពេលប្រមាណជា៤ឆ្នាំកន្លងមក នេះ អតិថិជនដែលបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មបានបង្ហាញថា មួយក្នុងចំណោមកត្តារុញច្រានទាំង១៣ ការ ធ្វើការសម្រេចចិត្ត គឺជាកត្តាមួយដ៏សំខាន់ ដែលតែងតែកើតឡើងម្តង ឬច្រើនជាងនេះ។ ជាញឹកញាប់ កត្តារុញច្រានទាំងនេះហាក់បីដូចជាច្របល់បញ្ចូលគ្នា នៅពេលជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះរៀបរាប់អំពីការសម្រេច ចិត្តរបស់ពួកគេ និងបុព្វហេតុ ដែលធ្វើអោយជីវិតពួកគេប្រែប្រូល។

បញ្ហាក្នុងការរក្សាតុល្យភាពជីវិត៖ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះដែលបានធ្វើសមាហរណកម្មរួចហើយ បានបង្ហាញ អំពីសមត្ថភាពសម្របខ្លួន មានចំនួនតិចតួចបំផុត ក្នុងការសិក្សាស្រាវជ្រាវស្តីពីភាពឆាប់ត្រលប់មកធម្មតា វិញ។ អតិថិជនភាគច្រើនមានបញ្ហាពិបាកក្នុងការរក្សាតុល្យភាពការងារ និងកាតព្វកិច្ចចម្បងៗនានានៅ ក្នុងជីវិតរបស់ពួកគេ។ មានឧទាហរណ៍ជាច្រើន ដែលបានបង្ហាញថា កម្មវិធីអង្គការបានជួយយ៉ាងច្រើន តាមរយៈការភ្ជាប់ទំនាក់ទំនងជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះទៅនឹងរចនាសម្ព័ន្ធជំនួយ ដូចជាក្រុមជំនុំក្នុងសហគមន៍ និងអង្គការក្នុងស្រុកដទៃៗទៀត។ យ៉ាងណាមិញ យោងតាមការសិក្សានេះ ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះភាគច្រើន មិនសូវមានចំណេះដឹង ឬជំនាញគ្រប់គ្រាន់ក្នុងបង្កើតបណ្តាញទំនាក់ទំនងដោយខ្លួនឯងទេ ក្រៅពីទំនាក់ ទំនងក្នុងសហគមន៍ដែលពួកគេរស់នៅ។ គ្មានអតិថិជនណាមួយនិយាយអំពីការមានទំនាក់ទំនងជាមួយ ក្រុមជំនុំដោយខ្លួនឯងនោះទេ លើកលែងតែមានជំនួយពីអង្គការ។ ផ្នែកមួយនេះ ក្នុងសហគមន៍ត្រូវបាន ត្រូវបានចាត់ទុកថាជាចំណុចមួយដ៏សំខាន់ ប៉ុន្តែវាមានចំនុចខ្វះខាតនៅឡើយចំពោះការភ្ជាប់ទំនាក់ទំនង នេះសម្រាប់ជនរួចពីរងគ្រោះនាពេលបច្ចុប្បន្ននេះ។